

The following supplement accompanies the article

## Effects of ocean acidification on the settlement and metamorphosis of marine invertebrate and fish larvae: a review

Nadjeжда Espinel-Velasco\*, Linn Hoffmann, Antonio Agüera, Maria Byrne, Sam Dupont, Sven Uthicke, Nicole S. Webster, Miles Lamare

\*Corresponding author: nadjeжда.espinel@otago.ac.nz

*Marine Ecology Progress Series 606: 237–257 (2018)*

**Table S1** Field studies that explore aspects of the effects of elevated  $p\text{CO}_2$  on settlement (or recruitment) of marine organisms at naturally occurring  $\text{CO}_2$  vents. The table summarises the information available on the organism studied, the location of the  $\text{CO}_2$  vent site and the different  $p\text{CO}_2$  levels present, as well as the effects shown by each study. The table comprises information on different taxa of invertebrates, algae and bacterial communities. Although this review manuscript focuses on marine (invertebrate and fish) larvae, this table also includes other organisms that have previously been studied at the  $\text{CO}_2$  vents.

| Phylum, species                                      | Vent site     | $p\text{CO}_2$ levels  | Effects found  | References           |
|--|---------------|--|--|----------------------|
| Different taxa, benthic invertebrates and microfauna | Ischia, Italy | - Stations N1 & S1, normal pH conditions (8.06 - 8.15)   | Calcareous foraminiferans, serpulid polychaetes, gastropods and bivalves showed highly significant reductions in recruitment with increase in $p\text{CO}_2$   | Cigliano et al. 2010 |
|  |               | - Stations N2 and S2, intermediate pH conditions with high pH fluctuations: range 7.27–7.99 and 7.49–7.89, | Only one species of polychaete had higher abundances at the station presenting the lowest pH values, although a wide range of polychaetes and small crustaceans was able to settle and survive under these conditions. |                      |
|  |               | - Stations N3 and S3, low pH conditions: range 7.26–7.60 and 7.08–7.79                                     | A few taxa were particularly abundant at stations presenting intermediate amounts of $p\text{CO}_2$  |                      |

| Phylum, species   | Vent site             | pCO <sub>2</sub> levels   | Effects found  | References           |
|---|-----------------------|---|--|----------------------|
| Algae   | Ischia, Italy         | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Normal pH = Sn (pH<sub>T</sub> 8.06 ± SD 0.09)</li> <li>- Normal pH=Nn (pH<sub>T</sub> 7.95 ± SD 0.06)</li> <li>- Medium pH = Sm (pH<sub>T</sub> 7.75 ± SD 0.3)</li> <li>- Medium pH = Nm (pH<sub>T</sub> 7.77 ± SD 0.19)</li> <li>- Low pH = S1 (pH<sub>T</sub> 6.59 ± SD 0.51)</li> <li>- Low pH = N1 (pH<sub>T</sub> 7.20 ± SD 0.36)</li> </ul> | Decrease in number of species recorded in reduced seawater pH stations   | Porzio et al. 2013   |
| Benthic invertebrates (polychaetes, amphipod, isopod and tanaid crustaceans and molluscs)                           | Ischia, Italy         | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Stations N1 &amp; S1, normal pH conditions: 8.06 – 8.15</li> <li>- Stations N2 &amp; S2, intermediate pH conditions with high pH fluctuations: 7.27–7.99 and 7.49–7.89,</li> <li>- Stations N3 &amp; S3, low pH conditions: 7.26–7.60 and 7.08–7.79</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- No significant differences in # of organisms settled</li> <li>- Significant differences in diversity</li> <li>- Normal pH stations were significantly more diverse</li> </ul>                     | Ricevuto et al. 2012 |
| Microalgal assemblages (periphyton)   | Vulcano Island, Italy | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ambient pH (mean 8.18)</li> <li>- Intermediate pH (mean 8.05)</li> <li>- Low pH (mean 7.49)</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Significant changes in periphyton communities</li> <li>- Increase in chl a concentration and in diatom abundance with increasing pCO<sub>2</sub></li> <li>- No change in cyanobacteria</li> </ul> | Johnson et al. 2013  |
| Benthic polychaete species: <i>Amphiglena mediterranea</i> , <i>Platynereis dumerilii</i> , <i>Syllis prolifera</i> | Ischia, Italy         | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Control N1 = pH 8.0 ± 0.1</li> <li>- Control S1 = pH 8.1 ± 0.1</li> <li>- Intermediate N2 = pH 7.8 ± 0.2</li> <li>- Intermediate S2 = pH 7.8 ± 0.3</li> <li>- Acidified N3 = pH 7.2 ± 0.4</li> <li>- Acidified S3 = pH 6.6 ± 0.5</li> </ul>  | Significant increase in abundance of the three target species in reduced seawater pH conditions  | Ricevuto et al. 2014 |
| Bacterial and archaeal communities  | Papua New Guinea      | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- low pCO<sub>2</sub>: pH<sub>T</sub> 7.97–8.14, 296–494ppm pCO<sub>2</sub></li> <li>- high pCO<sub>2</sub>: pH<sub>T</sub> 7.73–8.00, 444–953ppm pCO<sub>2</sub></li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Increased microbial richness with increase in pCO<sub>2</sub></li> <li>- Shift in microbial composition along the natural gradient</li> </ul>   | Raulf et al. 2015    |

| Phylum, species  | Vent site   | pCO <sub>2</sub> levels   | Effects found  | References               |
|--|---|---|--|--------------------------|
| Microborers<br>(cyanobacteria,<br>chlorophytes,<br>rhodophytes and<br>fungi) | Maug,<br>Commonwealth of<br>the Northern<br>Mariana Islands | - High pCO <sub>2</sub> site: mean pH 7.94±0.051<br>- Mid- pCO <sub>2</sub> site: mean pH 7.98 ± 0.027<br>- Control pCO <sub>2</sub> site: mean pH 8.04 ± 0.016   | Increased colonization (settlement) of<br>microbores at lower pH (higher pCO <sub>2</sub> )  | Enochs et<br>al. 2016    |
| Crustose<br>Coralline Algae  | Papua New Guinea  | - Control sites: pH <sub>T</sub> 8.02 - 7.98 / pCO <sub>2</sub> 346 -<br>413 µatm<br>- High CO <sub>2</sub> sites: pH <sub>T</sub> 7.95 - 7.72/ 441 - 998<br>µatm | Total CCA cover decreased with increase<br>in pCO <sub>2</sub>   | Fabricius et<br>al. 2015 |
| Vermetids<br>(gastropoda)  | Vulcano Island,<br>Italy                                    | - Low pH: ~7.31<br>- Mid pH: ~ 7.73<br>- High pH: ~ 8.03<br>- CTL Vent: ~ 8.15  | Recruitment success adversely affected at<br>the Low and the Mid pH sites  | Milazzo et<br>al. 2014   |
| Tropical coral<br>recruits   | Papua New Guinea  | - Low pH: ~ 7.8<br>- High pH: ~ 8.0   | - Reduced coral settlement and<br>recruitment in presence of substrates<br>(CCA) pre-conditioned at low pH.<br>- Lower settlement associated with<br>reduced CCA cover at reduced pH site.   | Fabricius et<br>al. 2017 |
| Calcareous<br>species of<br>invertebrates<br>Fleshy seaweeds                 | Ischia, Italy   | - Control pH <sub>north,south</sub> = 8.0, 8.1<br>- Low pH <sub>north,south</sub> = 7.8, 7.8<br>- Extreme low pH < 7.4  | - Early successional stages: Similar rates<br>of recruitment of calcareous species at<br>both ambient and low pH sites<br>- Later succession: Fleshy seaweeds in<br>low pH conditions  | Kroeker et<br>al. 2013a  |
| Benthic rocky reef<br>assemblages  | Ischia, Italy   | - Control pH <sub>north,south</sub> = 8.0, 8.1<br>- Low pH <sub>north,south</sub> = 7.8, 7.8<br>- Extreme low pH < 7.4  | - Significantly different communities<br>among pH zones after 32 months:<br>- dominance of calcareous algae in<br>ambient pH;<br>- dominance of fleshy algae in low pH<br>zones;<br>- dominance of biofilm/filamentous algae<br>and erect fleshy algae in extreme low pH<br>zones; | Kroeker et<br>al. 2013b  |

| Phylum, species          | Vent site     | $p\text{CO}_2$ levels   | Effects found  | References          |
|--------------------------|---------------|---|--|---------------------|
|                          |               |   | - greater variability in the communities in the ambient and extreme low pH zones.  |                     |
| Crustose coralline algae | Ischia, Italy | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Control <math>\text{pH}_{\text{north,south}} = 8.0, 8.1</math></li> <li>- Low <math>\text{pH}_{\text{north,south}} = 7.8, 7.8</math></li> <li>- Extreme low <math>\text{pH} &lt; 7.4</math></li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Lower CCA abundance in the low pH</li> <li>- CCA settled in extreme low pH were significantly smaller and presented altered mineralogy</li> </ul> | Kamenos et al. 2016 |

**Table S2:** Single stressor laboratory studies that explore ocean acidification induced changes in larval settlement for different taxonomic groups. The table includes information on the pH treatments or  $p\text{CO}_2$  levels tested, the effects found and the biogeographical region of origin of the species tested.

| Phylum, species            | pH or $p\text{CO}_2$ range tested   | Effects found  | References             | Region       |
|----------------------------|---|--|------------------------|--------------|
| <b>Cnidaria</b>            |   |  |                        |              |
| <i>Acropora digitifera</i> | - pH <sub>T</sub> 8.0<br>- pH <sub>T</sub> 7.6<br>- pH <sub>T</sub> 7.3   | Significant decline in metamorphosis rate under reduced seawater pH conditions after both short (2 h) and long (7 d) term exposure | Nakamura et al. 2011   | Japan        |
| <i>Acropora gemmifera</i>  | - pH 8.1<br>- pH 7.8<br>- pH 7.5  | Reduced settlement percentage in lower pH treatments   | Yuan et al. 2018       | China        |
| <i>Acropora millepora</i>  | - control (pH 8.04, 401 $\mu\text{atm CO}_2$ )<br>- Future $\text{CO}_2$ concentrations #1 (pH 7.79, 807 $\mu\text{atm}$ )<br>- Future $\text{CO}_2$ concentrations #2 (pH 7.60, 1299 $\mu\text{atm}$ ) | Negative effects on settlement due to increased $p\text{CO}_2$   | Doropoulos et al. 2012 | Australia    |
| <i>Acropora palmata</i>    | - average ambient $p\text{CO}_2$ conditions (~400 $\mu\text{atm}$ )<br>- Mid- $\text{CO}_2$ conditions (~560 $\mu\text{atm}$ )<br>- High- $\text{CO}_2$ conditions (~800 $\mu\text{atm}$ )              | Settlement was negatively impacted by increasing $p\text{CO}_2$  | Albright et al. 2010   | Florida, USA |

| Phylum, species                                 | pH or pCO <sub>2</sub> range tested  | Effects found   | References                    | Region    |
|---|--|---|-------------------------------|-----------|
| <i>Acropora selago</i>                          | - Ambient (pH 7.98, 447 $\mu$ atm CO <sub>2</sub> )<br>- Mid elevated treatment (pH 7.81, 705 $\mu$ atm CO <sub>2</sub> )<br>- High elevated treatment (pH 7.60, 1214 $\mu$ atm CO <sub>2</sub> )        | Negative effects on settlement. Settlement decreased with increase in pCO <sub>2</sub> for all CCA taxa.  | Doropoulos & Diaz-Pulido 2013 | Australia |
| <i>Acropora spicifera</i>                       | - Control pCO <sub>2</sub> : $\pm$ 250 uatm<br>- High pCO <sub>2</sub> : + 900 uatm  | No significant effects on settlement  | Foster et al. 2015            | Australia |
| <i>Acropora tenuis</i>                          | - Control pH<br>- Reduced pH 7.6 (1000 $\mu$ atm CO <sub>2</sub> )   | No effects on settlement  | Kurihara 2008                 | Japan     |
| <i>Acropora millepora</i>                       | <i>Experiment 1:</i><br>Larval settlement on pre conditioned CCA (pH 8.1, pH 7.9, pH 7.7 and pH 7.5)<br>pH treatments: 8.1, 7.9, 7.7 and 7.5   | Reduced settlement on CCA pre-exposed to different pH treatments  | Webster et al. 2013b          | Australia |
|   | <i>Experiment 2:</i><br>Larval settlement on conditioned CCA at ambient pH (8.1)<br>pH treatments: 8.1, 7.9, 7.7 and 7.5   | No significant effects on settlement  |                               |           |
| <i>Acropora millepora &amp; Acropora tenuis</i> | <i>Experiment 3:</i><br>Larval settlement on CCA extract. Larvae preconditioned for 24h in different treatments (pH 8.1, pH 7.9, pH 7.7 and pH 7.5)<br>Experimental pH treatments: 8.1, 7.9, 7.7 and 7.5 | No significant effects on settlement  |                               |           |
| <i>Pocillopora damicornis</i>                   | - Control pH = 8.1<br>- Treatment 1: pH = 7.9<br>- Treatment 2: pH = 7.6   | Decrease in pH caused a strong decline in larval settlement rates, with the lowest rate at pH 7.6. At pH 7.9 and 7.6 all larvae were unable to complete | Viyakarn et al. 2015          | Thailand  |

| Phylum, species           | pH or $p\text{CO}_2$ range tested  | Effects found  | References              | Region       |
|---------------------------|--|--|-------------------------|--------------|
|                           |  | metamorphosis  |                         |              |
| <i>Porites asteroides</i> | - pH 8.1<br>- pH 7.6   | No significant effects of reduced pH on coral settlement   | Olsen et al. 2015       | Florida, USA |
| <i>Porites asteroides</i> | - present $p\text{CO}_2$ conditions (380 ppm)<br>- projected $p\text{CO}_2$ for the year 2065 (560 ppm)<br>- projected $p\text{CO}_2$ for the year 2100 (720 ppm)                                  | No direct correlation between increase of $p\text{CO}_2$ and decrease on settlement  | Albright et al. 2008    | Florida, USA |
| <i>Porites astreoides</i> | - ambient $p\text{CO}_2$ conditions (380 $\mu\text{atm}$ )<br>- middle century predicted $p\text{CO}_2$ (560 $\mu\text{atm}$ )<br>- end of century predicted $p\text{CO}_2$ (800 $\mu\text{atm}$ ) | - Significant effects on settlement, but only in tiles preconditioned in high $p\text{CO}_2$ seawater conditions - indirect effects by altering settlement substrate | Albright & Langdon 2011 | Florida, USA |
| <b>Annelida</b>           |  |  |                         |              |
| <i>Hydroides elegans</i>  | - Control: $\text{pH}_{\text{NBS}}$ 8.17<br>- Reduced: $\text{pH}_{\text{NBS}}$ 7.56   | No effects on settlement and metamorphosis   | Lane et al. 2013        | Hong Kong    |
| <b>Mollusca</b>           |  |  |                         |              |

| Phylum, species  | pH or pCO <sub>2</sub> range tested  | Effects found   | References           | Region              |
|--|--|---|----------------------|---------------------|
| <b>Gastropoda</b>  |  |   |                      |                     |
| <i>Haliotis diversicolor</i> and <i>H. discus hannai</i> | - Control pCO <sub>2</sub> : 447 μatm ~ pH <sub>NBS</sub> 8.15<br>- High pCO <sub>2</sub> :<br>1500 μatm ~ pH <sub>NBS</sub> 7.7<br>2000 μatm ~ pH <sub>NBS</sub> 7.6<br>3000 μatm ~ pH <sub>NBS</sub> 7.4 | <u>Reduced survival and metamorphosis</u>   | Guo et al. 2015      | China               |
| <i>Crepidula fornicata</i>                               | - pH <sub>T</sub> 7.51<br>- pH <sub>T</sub> 7.71<br>- pH <sub>T</sub> 7.96   | <u>Significantly higher settlement and metamorphosis at lower pH</u>                        | Dooley & Pires 2015  | Washington, USA     |
| <b>Bivalvia</b>  |  |   |                      |                     |
| <i>Macoma balthica</i>                                   | - Ambient pH <sub>T1</sub> = 7.94<br>- Ambient pH <sub>T2</sub> = 7.94<br>- pH <sub>T3</sub> = 7.80<br>- pH <sub>T4</sub> = 7.51<br>- pH <sub>T5</sub> = 7.43  | Negative effects on settlement due to reduced pH  | Jansson et al. 2016  | Baltic Sea          |
| <b>Bryozoa</b>   |  |   |                      |                     |
| <i>Bugula neritina</i>                                   | Range pH treatments (8.0 to 6.5)   | - Time to settle increased with reduction in pH.<br>- No lethal effects showed at lower pH. | Pecquet et al. 2017  | Hong Kong           |
| <b>Arthropoda</b>  |  |   |                      |                     |
| <b>Maxillopoda</b>                                       |  |   |                      |                     |
| <i>Amphibalanus amphitrite</i>                           | - Ambient pH 8.2<br>- Low pH 7.4   | No influence on settlement due to reduced pH  | McDonald et al. 2009 | North Carolina, USA |



| <b>Phylum, species</b>                   | <b>pH or <math>p\text{CO}_2</math> range tested</b>  | <b>Effects found</b>   | <b>References</b>    | <b>Region</b>                       |
|--|--|--|----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| <i>Balanus amphitrite</i>                | - Ambient pH: 8.2<br>- Low pH: 7.6   | No influence on settlement due to reduced pH   | Campanati 2016       | Hong Kong                           |
| <i>Malacostraca</i>                      |  |  |                      |                                     |
| <i>Stenopus hispidus</i>                 | - 400 ppm $\text{CO}_2$ (current-day control)<br>- 700 ppm $\text{CO}_2$<br>- 850 ppm $\text{CO}_2$                  | Significant negative effects in ability to recognize conspecific cues important for settlement | Lecchini et al. 2017 | French Polynesia<br>Japan           |
| <b>Echinodermata</b>                     |  |  |                      |                                     |
| <u>Echinoidea</u>                        |  |  |                      |                                     |
| <i>Paracentrotus lividus</i>             | - Present average pH 8.1<br>- Average predicted for 2100, pH 7.7<br>- Extreme predicted for 2100, pH 7.4             | - Delay in larval settlement at pH 7.7<br>- No successful settlement at pH 7.4                 | García et al. 2015   | Mediterranean and NE Atlantic Ocean |
| <i>Strongylocentrotus droebachiensis</i> | - $\text{pH}_T = 8.07$ ( $\sim 361 \mu\text{atm CO}_2$ )<br>- $\text{pH}_T = 7.69$ ( $\sim 942 \mu\text{atm CO}_2$ ) | No significant effect of $p\text{CO}_2$ in larval settlement                                   | Dupont et al. 2013   | Boreal coastal ecosystems           |
| <u>Asteroidea</u>                        |  |  |                      |                                     |

| <b>Phylum, species</b>         | <b>pH or pCO<sub>2</sub> range tested</b>  | <b>Effects found</b>  | <b>References</b>    | <b>Region</b>             |
|--------------------------------|--|---|----------------------|---------------------------|
| <i>Acanthaster cf. solaris</i> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Pre-industrial pH<sub>NBS</sub> 8.25 target</li> <li>- Present conditions pH<sub>NBS</sub> 8.1 target</li> <li>- Future medium conditions pH<sub>NBS</sub> 8.0 target</li> <li>- Future low conditions pH<sub>NBS</sub> 7.9 target</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Significant negative effects on settlement when settlement substrates were previously conditioned in the different pH treatments.</li> <li>- No significant effects on settlement only due to water chemistry (settlement experiment 2)</li> </ul> | Uthicke et al. 2013  | Australia                 |
| <b>Fish</b>                    |  |   |                      |                           |
| <i>Amphiprion percula</i>      | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Control pH 8.15</li> <li>- Predictions for the year 2100: pH 7.8</li> <li>- Low pH 7.6</li> </ul>   | Significant reduction in homing behaviour due to loss in olfactory capacity   | Munday et al. 2009   | Australia                 |
| <i>Chromis viridis</i>         | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 400 ppm CO<sub>2</sub> (current-day control)</li> <li>- 700 ppm CO<sub>2</sub></li> <li>- 850 ppm CO<sub>2</sub></li> </ul>   | Significant negative effects in ability to recognize conspecific cues important for settlement  | Lecchini et al. 2017 | French Polynesia<br>Japan |

| <b>Phylum, species</b>         | <b>pH or <math>p\text{CO}_2</math> range tested</b>   | <b>Effects found</b>   | <b>References</b>    | <b>Region</b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|--|----------------------|--|
| <i>Lates calcarifer</i>        | pH 8.19 ~ 400 $\mu\text{atm CO}_2$<br>pH 7.70 ~1675 $\mu\text{atm CO}_2$                            | Negative effects of elevated $p\text{CO}_2$ in the auditory preference of the fish at time of settlement | (Rossi et al. 2015)  | Tropical areas between eastern Indian Ocean to the western Central Pacific |
| <i>Lates calcarifer</i>        | - pH 8.13 ~ 465 $\mu\text{atm CO}_2$<br>- pH 7.70 ~1477 $\mu\text{atm CO}_2$                        | Negative effects of reduced pH on attraction by larval fish towards physico-chemical cues for settlement | Pistevos et al. 2017 | Tropical areas between eastern Indian Ocean to the western Central Pacific |
| <i>Pomacentrus amboinensis</i> | - 440 ppm $\text{CO}_2$ (current-day control)<br>- 700 ppm $\text{CO}_2$<br>- 850 ppm $\text{CO}_2$ | Impairment in olfactory discrimination of settlement cues  | Devine et al. 2012   | Australia  |

| Phylum,<br>species           | pH or $p\text{CO}_2$ range tested   | Effects found   | References         | Region                                       |
|------------------------------|---|---|--------------------|--|
| <i>Pomatoschistus pictus</i> | - pH 8.06 ~ 530 $\mu\text{atm CO}_2$<br>- pH 7.66 ~ 1500 $\mu\text{atm CO}_2$ | Negative effects of high $\text{CO}_2$ in auditory responses important for settlement | Castro et al. 2017 | Eastern Atlantic Ocean and Mediterranean Sea |

**Table S3:** Multiple stressor laboratory studies that explore changes in settlement caused by ocean acidification (OA) in conjunction with a second stressor. This table includes information on taxa, OA treatment levels and other stressors tested, as well as biogeographical region of origin of the species tested.

| Phylum, species                   | OA Treatments   | Other stressor tested   | Effects on settlement  | References           | Region                          |
|-----------------------------------|---|---|------------------------|----------------------|---------------------------------|
| <b>Porifera</b>                   |   |   |                        |                      |                                 |
| <i>Carteriospongia foliascens</i> | - pH <sub>T</sub> = 8.1<br>- pH <sub>T</sub> = 7.8<br>- pH <sub>T</sub> = 7.6   | T = 28.5°C<br>T = 30°C<br>T = 31.5°C  | No significant effects | Bennett et al. 2016  | Australia                       |
| <b>Cnidaria</b>                   |   |   |                        |                      |                                 |
| <i>Acropora spicifera</i>         | - Control pCO <sub>2</sub> = ± 250 µatm<br>- High pCO <sub>2</sub> = ± 900 µatm | Control T = 24°C<br>High T = 27°C   | No significant effects | Foster et al. 2015   | Subtropical - Western Australia |
| <i>Porites astreoides</i>         | - pH = 8.0<br>- pH = 7.85   | - Contact with the alga <i>Styopodium zonale</i><br>- Two settlement substrates:<br>- CCA<br>- Tiles with biofilm | No significant effects | Campbell et al. 2017 | Caribbean                       |

| Phylum, species           | OA Treatments  | Other stressor tested  | Effects on settlement  | References            | Region                   |
|---------------------------|--|--|--|-----------------------|--------------------------|
| <i>Porites astreoides</i> | - pH = 8.1<br>- pH = 7.6                                   | Two Temperatures:<br>- Ambient (28°C),<br>- Elevated (31°C)<br><br>Two settlement substrates:<br>- Plastic algal mimic<br>- Live Dictyota spp. | No significant effects   | Olsen et al. 2015     | Caribbean                |
| <i>Porites panamensis</i> | - Control pH = 8.08<br>- Low pH = 7.85                     | Control T = 28.4°C<br>High T = 29.6 °C   | No significant effects   | Anlauf et al. 2011    | Tropical Eastern Pacific |
| <b>Mollusca</b>           |  |  |  |                       |                          |
| <i>Gastropoda</i>         |  |  |  |                       |                          |
| <i>Crepidula onyx</i>     | - Control pH = 8.00<br>- Medium pH = 7.7<br>- Low pH = 7.3 | Algae grown at<br>- Control pH = 8.00<br>- Medium pH = 7.7<br>- Low pH = 7.3   | - No effects of pH or diet alone on the settlement<br><br>- Enhanced settlement at low pH + diet low quality | (Maboloc & Chan 2017) | Hong Kong                |
| <i>Bivalvia</i>           |  |  |  |                       |                          |

| Phylum, species   | OA Treatments   | Other stressor tested  | Effects on settlement  | References                | Region                                      |
|---|---|--|--|---------------------------|---|
| <i>Magallana gigas</i> (formerly <i>Crassostrea gigas</i> ) | - pH <sub>NBS</sub> 8.04<br>- pH <sub>NBS</sub> 7.47  | - Temperature: 24 and 30 °C<br>- Salinity: 15 and 25 psu   | - Reduced metamorphosis due to carryover effects in larvae<br>- Significant delays in pre- and post-settlement growth.                               | Ko et al. 2014            | China                                       |
| <b>Arthropoda</b>   |   |  |  |                           |   |
| <i>Maxillopoda</i>  |   |  |  |                           |   |
| <i>Amphibalanus improvisus</i>                              | pCO <sub>2</sub> = 400 µatm<br>pCO <sub>2</sub> = 1250 µatm<br>pCO <sub>2</sub> = 3250 µatm | - T = 12°C<br>- T = 20°C<br>- T = 27°C   | No significant effects   | (Pansch et al. 2012)      | Baltic Sea                                  |
| <i>Balanus amphitrite</i>                                   | pCO <sub>2</sub> = 400µatm<br>pCO <sub>2</sub> = 750 µatm<br>pCO <sub>2</sub> = 1500 µatm   | - Four temperatures (28°C, 30°C, 32°C and 34°C)<br>- Two nutrient conditions (unenriched and enriched) | - No direct effect on settlement due to acidification alone<br>- Reduced settlement due to warming individually or in combination with acidification | (Baragi & Anil 2017)      | India                                       |
| <b>Echinodermata</b>  |   |  |  |                           |   |
| <i>Echinoidea</i>   |   |  |  |                           |   |
| <i>Arbacia lixula</i>                                       | pH <sub>T</sub> = 8.09<br>pH <sub>T</sub> = 7.69  | T = 16.0 °C<br>T = 17.5 °C<br>T = 19.0 °C  | Reduced settlement   | (Wangensteen et al. 2013) | Mediterranean and tropical Eastern Atlantic |

| Phylum, species                   | OA Treatments   | Other stressor tested               | Effects on settlement   | References               | Region                |
|-----------------------------------|---|-------------------------------------|---|--------------------------|-----------------------|
| <i>Heliocidaris erythrogramma</i> | pH = 7.8<br>pH = 7.6  | T = +2 °C<br>T = +4 °C              | No effects on settlement in control pH treatments at both temperatures (Effects on settlement not reported for low pH treatments) | (Byrne, Ho, et al. 2011) | Subtropical Australia |
| <i>Heliocidaris erythrogramma</i> | pH treatments at which the CCA were conditioned prior to larval settlement assays :<br>pH = 8.1<br>pH = 7.6 | Temperature:<br>- 20.5°C<br>- 24 °C | Reduction in larval settlement when placed in presence of CCA conditioned under any of the elevated temperatures                  | (Huggett et al. 2018)    | Subtropical Australia |



| Phylum,<br>species           | OA Treatments                    | Other stressor tested                | Effects on settlement   | References           | Region  |
|------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|----------------------|---|
| <i>Paracentrotus lividus</i> | pH = 8.1<br>pH = 7.7<br>pH = 7.4 | T = 19°C<br>T = 20.5°C<br>T = 22.5°C | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- No settlement observed at the lowest T and pH.</li> <li>- Unsuccessful settlement at the highest T and lowest pH (7.4).</li> <li>- The rest of the results show no significant effect on settlement due to reduced pH.</li> <li>- Enhanced settlement at 20.5°C</li> </ul> | (García et al. 2015) | Mediterranean and NE Atlantic Ocean, from Ireland to Canary Islands |

## References supplementary material

- Albright R, Langdon C (2011) Ocean acidification impacts multiple early life history processes of the Caribbean coral *Porites astreoides*. *Global Change Biology* 17:2478–2487
- Albright R, Mason B, Langdon C (2008) Effect of aragonite saturation state on settlement and post-settlement growth of *Porites astreoides* larvae. *Coral Reefs* 27:485–490
- Albright R, Mason B, Miller M, Langdon C (2010) Ocean acidification compromises recruitment success of the threatened Caribbean coral *Acropora palmata*. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 107:20400–20404
- Anlauf H, D’Croze L, O’Dea A (2011) A corrosive concoction: The combined effects of ocean warming and acidification on the early growth of a stony coral are multiplicative. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 397:13–20
- Baragi L V, Anil AC (2017) Influence of elevated temperature,  $p\text{CO}_2$ , and nutrients on larva-biofilm interaction: Elucidation with acorn barnacle, *Balanus amphitrite* Darwin (Cirripedia: Thoracica). *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 185:107–119
- Bennett HM, Altenrath C, Woods L, Davy SK, Webster NS, Bell JJ (2016) Interactive effects of temperature and  $p\text{CO}_2$  on sponges: From the cradle to the grave. *Global Change Biology* 23:2031–2046
- Byrne M, Ho M, Wong E, Soars NA, Selvakumaraswamy P, Shepard-Brennan H, Dworjanyn SA, Davis AR (2011) Unshelled abalone and corrupted urchins: development of marine calcifiers in a changing ocean. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 278:2376–2383
- Campanati C (2016) Combined effects of low pH and low oxygen on the early-life stages of the barnacle *Balanus amphitrite*. *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 73:791–802
- Campbell JE, Sneed JM, Johnston L, Paul VJ (2017) Effects of ocean acidification and contact with the brown alga *Styopodium zonale* on the settlement and early survival of the coral *Porites astreoides*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 577:67–77
- Castro JM, Amorim MCP, Oliveira AP, Gonçalves EJ, Munday PL, Simpson SD, Faria AM (2017) Painted Goby larvae under high- $\text{CO}_2$  fail to recognize reef sounds. *Plos One* 12(1): e0170838
- Cigliano M, Gambi MC, Rodolfo-Metalpa R, Patti FP, Hall-Spencer JM (2010) Effects of ocean acidification on invertebrate settlement at volcanic  $\text{CO}_2$  vents. *Marine Biology* 157:2489–2502
- Devine BM, Munday PL, Jones GP (2012) Rising  $\text{CO}_2$  concentrations affect settlement behaviour of larval damselfishes. *Coral Reefs* 31:229–238
- Dooley T, Pires A (2015) The effect of pH on natural settlement and metamorphosis in the invasive limpet, *Crepidula fornicata*. Blinks-NSF REU-BEACON Research Fellowship 2015. Friday Harbor Laboratories, University of Washington, WA
- Doropoulos C, Diaz-Pulido G (2013) High  $\text{CO}_2$  reduces the settlement of a spawning coral on three common species of crustose coralline algae. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 475:93–99
- Doropoulos C, Ward S, Diaz-Pulido G, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Mumby PJ (2012) Ocean acidification reduces coral recruitment by disrupting intimate larval-algal settlement interactions. *Ecology Letters* 15:338–346

- Dupont S, Dorey N, Stumpp M, Melzner F, Thorndyke M (2013) Long-term and trans-life-cycle effects of exposure to ocean acidification in the green sea urchin *Strongylocentrotus droebachiensis*. *Marine Biology* 160:1835–1843
- Enochs IC, Manzello DP, Tribollet A, Valentino L, Kolodziej G, Donham EM, Fitchett MD, Carlton R, Price NN (2016) Elevated colonization of microborers at a volcanically acidified coral reef. *PLoS ONE* 11:1–16
- Fabricius KE, Klübenschedl A, Harrington L, Noonan S, De'ath G (2015) In situ changes of tropical crustose coralline algae along carbon dioxide gradients. *Scientific Reports* 5:9537
- Fabricius KE, Noonan SHC, Abrego D, Harrington L, De'ath G (2017) Low recruitment due to altered settlement substrata as primary constraint for coral communities under ocean acidification. *Proc R Soc B* 284: 20171536. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2017.1536>
- Foster T, Gilmour JP, Chua CM, Falter JL, McCulloch MT (2015) Effect of ocean warming and acidification on the early life stages of subtropical *Acropora spicifera*. *Coral Reefs* 34:1217–1226
- García E, Hernández JC, Clemente S, Cohen-Rengifo M, Hernández CA, Dupont S (2015) Robustness of *Paracentrotus lividus* larval and post-larval development to pH levels projected for the turn of the century. *Marine Biology* 162:2047–2055
- Guo X, Huang M, Pu F, You W, Ke C (2015) Effects of ocean acidification caused by rising CO<sub>2</sub> on the early development of three mollusks. *Aquat Biol* 23: 147–157
- Huggett MJ, McMahon K, Bernasconi R (2018) Future warming and acidification result in multiple ecological impacts to a temperate coralline alga. *Environmental Microbiology*. Accepted Article', doi: 10.1111/1462-2920.14113.
- Jansson A, Lischka S, Boxhammer T, Schulz KG, Norkko J (2016) Survival and settling of larval *Macoma balthica* in a large-scale mesocosm experiment at different *f*CO<sub>2</sub> levels. *Biogeosciences*, 13, 3377–3385
- Johnson VR, Brownlee C, Rickaby REM, Graziano M, Milazzo M, Hall-Spencer JM (2013) Responses of marine benthic microalgae to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Marine Biology* 160:1813–1824
- Kamenos NA, Perna G, Gambi MC, Micheli F, Kroeker KJ (2016) Coralline algae in a naturally acidified ecosystem persist by maintaining control of skeletal mineralogy and size. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B* 283:20161159
- Ko GWK, Dineshram R, Campanati C, Chan VBS, Havenhand J, Thiyagarajan V (2014) Interactive effects of ocean acidification, elevated temperature and reduced salinity on early-life stages of the Pacific oyster. *Environ. Sci. Technol* 48: 10079–10088
- Kroeker KJ, Gambi MC, Micheli F (2013) Community dynamics and ecosystem simplification in a high-CO<sub>2</sub> ocean. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 110:12721–12726
- Kroeker KJ, Micheli F, Gambi MC (2013) Ocean acidification causes ecosystem shifts via altered competitive interactions. *Nature Climate Change* 3:156–159
- Kurihara H (2008) Effects of CO<sub>2</sub>-driven ocean acidification on the early developmental stages of invertebrates. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 373:275–284
- Lane AC, Mukherjee J, Chan VBS, Thiyagarajan V (2013) Decreased pH does not alter metamorphosis but compromises juvenile calcification of the tube worm *Hydroides elegans*. *Mar Biol* 160:1983–1993

- Lecchini D, Dixson DL, Lecellier G, Roux N, Frédérick B, Besson M, Tanaka Y, Banaigs B, Nakamura Y (2017) Habitat selection by marine larvae in changing chemical environments. *Marine Pollution Bulletin* 114:210–217
- Maboloc EA, Chan KYK (2017) Resilience of the larval slipper limpet *Crepidula onyx* to direct and indirect-diet effects of ocean acidification. *Scientific Reports* 7:1–9
- McDonald MR, McClintock JB, Amsler CD, Rittschof D, Angus RA, Orihuela B, Lutostanski K (2009) Effects of ocean acidification over the life history of the barnacle *Amphibalanus amphitrite*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 385:179–187
- Milazzo M, Rodolfo-Metalpa R, Chan VBS, Fine M, Alessi C, Thiyagarajan V, Hall-Spencer JM, Chemello R (2014) Ocean acidification impairs vermetid reef recruitment. *Scientific Reports* 17:1–7
- Munday PL, Dixson DL, Donelson JM, Jones GP, Pratchett MS, Devitsina GV, Døving KB (2009) Ocean acidification impairs olfactory discrimination and homing ability of a marine fish. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences U.S.A* 106:1848–1852
- Nakamura M, Ohki S, Suzuki A, Sakai K (2011) Coral larvae under ocean acidification: Survival, metabolism, and metamorphosis. *PLoS ONE* 6:1–8
- Olsen K, Paul VJ, Ross C (2015) Direct effects of elevated temperature, reduced pH, and the presence of macroalgae (*Dictyota* spp.) on larvae of the Caribbean coral *Porites astreoides*. *Bulletin of Marine Science* 91:255–270
- Pansch C, Nasrolahi A, Appelhans YS, Wahl M (2012) Impacts of ocean warming and acidification on the larval development of the barnacle *Amphibalanus improvisus*. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 420–421:48–55
- Pecquet A, Dorey N, Chan KYK (2017) Ocean acidification increases larval swimming speed and has limited effects on spawning and settlement of a robust fouling bryozoan, *Bugula neritina*. *Marine Pollution Bulletin* 124(2017):903–910
- Pistevos JCA, Nagelkerken I, Rossi T, Connell SD (2017) Ocean acidification alters temperature and salinity preferences in larval fish. *Oecologia* 183:545–553
- Porzio L, Garrard SL, Buia MC (2013) The effect of ocean acidification on early algal colonization stages at natural CO<sub>2</sub> vents. *Marine Biology* 160:2247–2259
- Raulf FF, Fabricius K, Uthicke S, de Beer D, Abed RMM, Ramette A (2015) Changes in microbial communities in coastal sediments along natural CO<sub>2</sub> gradients at a volcanic vent in Papua New Guinea. *Environmental Microbiology* 17:3678–3691
- Ricevuto E, Kroeker KJ, Ferrigno F, Micheli F, Gambi MC (2014) Spatio-temporal variability of polychaete colonization at volcanic CO<sub>2</sub> vents indicates high tolerance to ocean acidification. *Marine Biology* 161:2909–2919
- Ricevuto E, Lorenti M, Patti F (2012) Temporal trends of benthic invertebrate settlement along a gradient of ocean acidification at natural CO<sub>2</sub> vents (Tyrrhenian sea). *Biol Mar Mediterr* 19:49–52
- Rossi T, Nagelkerken I, Simpson SD, Pistevos JCA, Watson S-A, Merillett L, Fraser P, Munday PL, Connell SD (2015) Ocean acidification boosts larval fish development but reduces the window of opportunity for successful settlement. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B* 282: 20151954.
- Uthicke S, Pecorino D, Albright R, Negri AP, Cantin N, Liddy M, Dworjanyn S, Kamyra P, Byrne M, Lamare M (2013) Impacts of ocean acidification on early life-history stages and

settlement of the coral-eating sea star *Acanthaster planci*. PLoS ONE 8(12): e82938.  
doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0082938

Viyakarn V, Lalitpattarakit W, Chinfak N, Jandang S, Kuanui P, Khokiattiwong S, Chavanich S (2015) Effect of lower pH on settlement and development of coral, *Pocillopora damicornis* (Linnaeus, 1758). Ocean Sci. J 50:475–480

Wangensteen OS, Dupont S, Casties I, Turon X, Palacín C (2013) Some like it hot: Temperature and pH modulate larval development and settlement of the sea urchin *Arbacia lixula*. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 449:304–311

Webster NS, Uthicke S, Botté ES, Flores, Negri AP (2013) Ocean acidification reduces induction of coral settlement by crustose coralline algae. Global Change Biology 19:303–315

Yuan X, Yuan T, Huang H, Jiang L, Zhou W, Liu S (2018) Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> delays the early development of scleractinian coral *Acropora gemmifera*. Scientific Reports 8:2787