Ecosystem metabolism of benthic and pelagic zones of a shallow productive estuary: spatio-temporal variability

Peter A. Staehr^{1,*}, Eero Asmala^{1,2}, Jacob Carstensen¹, Dorte Krause-Jensen³, Heather Reader^{4,5}

¹Department of Bioscience, Aarhus University, Frederiksborgvej, 399, 4000 Roskilde, Denmark ²Tvärminne Zoological Station, University of Helsinki, J. A. Palménin tie 260, 10900 Hanko, Finland ³Department of Bioscience, Aarhus University, Vejlsøvej 25, 8600 Silkeborg, Denmark ⁴National Institute for Aquatic Resources, Technical University of Denmark, Building 202, Kemitorvet, 2800 Kgs. Lyngby, Denmark

⁵Department of Chemistry, Memorial University of Newfoundland, St John's, Newfoundland A1B 3X7, Canada

ABSTRACT: Long-term deterioration of water quality is known to reduce the importance of benthic ecosystem metabolism in shallow coastal ecosystems, but drivers of spatial and short-term variability in ecosystem metabolism are poorly understood. We addressed this knowledge gap through detailed seasonal measurements of ecosystem metabolism across depth gradients from shallow (2 to 3 m) eelgrass-dominated to deeper (4 to 5 m) muddy regions of a shallow, productive estuary. Combined measurements of gross primary production (GPP), respiration (R) and, by difference, net ecosystem production (NEP) by the open-water diel oxygen technique and in situ chamber incubations showed high importance of shallow eelgrass habitats for metabolism at the system scale. Seasonal variations in GPP, R and NEP increased with light availability and temperature with highest NEP in all habitats during the warm and sunny mid-summer. The shallow eelqrass-dominated and neighboring habitats were seasonally net autotrophic (NEP = 0.54 and 0.31 mg $O_2 m^{-2} d^{-1}$, respectively), compared to net heterotrophy (NEP = -0.26 mg $O_2 m^{-2} d^{-1}$) at the deeper muddy site. Detailed studies along depth gradients further confirmed the role of eelgrass as a key driver of spatial differences in ecosystem metabolism across the estuary. Strong northerly winds (>8 m s⁻¹) caused short-term (<24 h) periods of similar oxygen dynamics and similar apparent productivity in shallow and deeper waters, indicative of efficient lateral mixing, while calm periods ($<4 \text{ m s}^{-1}$) enabled formation of 'pockets', i.e. water masses with limited connectivity, which exacerbated the metabolic differences between shallow and deep sites.

KEY WORDS: Intra-estuarine heterogeneity \cdot Benthic habitat \cdot Pelagic habitat \cdot Temporal variability \cdot Eelgrass

- Resale or republication not permitted without written consent of the publisher

INTRODUCTION

Benthic primary producers such as seagrasses play important ecological roles as hotspots for production, storage and export of organic carbon (Duarte et al. 2013, Duarte 2017) in addition to efficiently retaining nutrients, stabilizing sediments and stimulating biodiversity in shallow coastal ecosystems (e.g. Hemminga & Duarte 2000). The relative importance of benthic and pelagic primary producers in shallow estuaries is largely a function of water clarity and strongly related to nutrient loading (Borum & SandJensen 1996). Shallow coastal seafloors typically have a high cover of benthic macrophytes in the well-lit photic zone, where they can contribute significantly to gross primary production (GPP) (Duarte & Chiscano 1999, McGlathery et al. 2001, Öberg 2006). Reductions in water clarity of shallow coastal waters, mostly due to eutrophication, have caused global losses and reduced depth colonization of seagrass meadows (Short & Wyllie-Echeverria 1996, Orth et al. 2006, Waycott et al. 2009). Historically, most of the Danish estuaries were dominated by the seagrass Zostera marina (eelgrass), but following the wasting disease in the 1930s and partial recovery thereafter, the extent and depth distribution of eelgrass decreased markedly as eutrophication reduced water clarity (Nielsen et al. 2002, Boström et al. 2014). For example, Limfjorden in Denmark experienced a shift from a pristine, benthic macrophytedominated clear water regime with high total GPP in the early 20th century to a eutrophic, planktondominated regime, still with high total GPP, in the 1980s when nutrient loadings peaked (Krause-Jensen et al. 2012). Nutrient loadings and concentrations in Danish coastal waters have decreased significantly since the 1980s, but improvements in water clarity and eelgrass depth colonization have been slow, with signs of recovery processes starting only recently (Riemann et al. 2016). While the eutrophication-induced transition from a benthic- to a pelagic-dominated system is well-documented, the reversal-oligotrophication-is less well understood (Duarte et al. 2009, Riemann et al. 2016), partly because of multiple feedback mechanisms (including unsuitable soft and organic-rich substratum) that potentially delay the return of the vegetation (Maxwell et al. 2017). A few recent studies, however, present trajectories of recovery and changes in overall productivity, with a reversal to a benthic-dominated system (McGlathery et al. 2012, Riemann et al. 2016, Staehr et al. 2017).

In shallow coastal ecosystems such as Roskilde Fjord, Denmark, where sufficient light reaches the sediment surface to support benthic primary production in most of the estuary (Staehr & Borum 2011), net ecosystem production (NEP) is expected to be autotrophic (NEP > 0) with GPP exceeding ecosystem respiration (R) (Ziegler & Benner 1998, Kemp & Testa 2011). This expectation agrees with observed long-term improvements in water clarity and greater depth limits of the dominant macrophyte, *Z. marina*, associated with increasingly autotrophic conditions (Staehr et al. 2017). Although several studies have assessed the relative roles of pelagic and benthic

compartments in shallow aquatic ecosystems (e.g. Borum & Sand-Jensen 1996, Van de Bogert et al. 2007, Krause-Jensen et al. 2012), few have allowed direct partitioning of the metabolic processes (e.g. Caffrey et al. 1998, Hume et al. 2011, Murrell et al. 2018). Moreover, the relative contribution of benthic versus pelagic primary producers along depth gradients and the temporal dynamics in ecosystem metabolism are poorly understood (Kamp-Nielsen 1992, Kemp & Testa 2011).

Moving from shallow well-illuminated to deeper shaded habitats will likely shift NEP from autotrophy to heterotrophy with increasing plankton R and decreasing benthic photosynthesis. In support of this, daily variations in oxygen and temperature show declines with depth, indicative of higher metabolic rates in the nearshore shallower waters related to the presence of rooted autotrophs (Odum 1967, Swaney et al. 1999). The partitioning of total ecosystem R between planktonic and benthic components is also expected to change with depth, as planktonic processes are strongly favored in deeper systems (e.g. Kemp & Boynton 1992, Heip et al. 1995). Moreover, temporal variation in external forcing variables, including sunlight, wind, meteorological tides and stream flow may cause significant day-to-day, and even hourly, variability in GPP, R and NEP (Staehr & Sand-Jensen 2007, Jennings et al. 2012). Hence, short-term hourly increases in wind-induced water turbulence can lead to higher rates of sediment resuspension, reducing water clarity, light penetration and photosynthesis (Arfi et al. 1993), as well as reintroduction of labile organic matter into the water column, stimulating planktonic *R* (Demers et al. 1987). Large daily variability in ecosystem production has been associated with variations in cloud cover and the resulting changes in sunlight (e.g. Fisher et al. 2003), as well as with wind-induced changes in mixing and resuspension (Staehr & Sand-Jensen 2007). Depending on water depth, sediment characteristics and density of macrophytes, such external forcing will interact with the complex local hydrodynamics associated with the canopy structure, eventually influencing oxygen dynamics and metabolic processes in nearshore shallow habitats differently (Hume et al. 2011).

In this study, we utilized high-frequency openwater measurements of oxygen, temperature, salinity and wind speed to investigate temporal and spatial variability in estuarine metabolism at sites with different benthic habitats and at different water depths. This enabled us to characterize the seasonality in GPP, R and NEP and investigate the regulatory importance of different external conditions over different time scales. Furthermore, a series of benthic and pelagic oxygen *in situ* incubation studies allowed assessment of the benthic and pelagic contributions to the ecosystem-integrated rates. Multiple measurements along a depth gradient made it possible to test expectations of larger magnitude of variability of ecosystem metabolism in shallow eelgrassdominated areas compared to deeper muddy parts of the estuary. These measurements along a depth gradient ultimately enabled us to evaluate the influence of meteorological forcing events for short-term oxygen dynamics in the coastal environment.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Study sites

Our study was conducted in the southern, inner part of Roskilde Fjord, a 30 km long, shallow estuary (mean depth 3 m, surface area 123 km²) in north Zealand, Denmark (Fig. 1). The outer part connects to the Kattegat through the Isefjord, while a sill restricts water transport between the outer and inner part of the estuary. The inner part is slightly shallower than the outer but has a larger surface area. The water column in the inner part of the estuary is well-mixed, with only short sub-diel stratification. Depending on the strength of wind-driven exchanges, the average water residence time in the inner part of the estuary ranges between 90 and 720 d (Kamp-Nielsen 1992, Josefson & Rasmussen 2000). Land use in the catchment is dominated by agriculture (67%), urban areas account for 15%, and the remaining watershed is covered with forests, wetlands and lakes. Roskilde, the largest city in the catchment, lies on the shore of the inner basin. Historically, Roskilde Fjord, like the rest of Denmark, had very extended eelgrass meadows (Petersen 1901, Steemann-Nielsen 1951), and while these were severely reduced by eutrophication, peaking in the 1980s, Roskilde Fjord and Denmark are still hotspots of eelgrass distribution and have experienced recent increases in eelgrass depth distribution (Riemann et al. 2016, Staehr et al. 2017).

Temporal variability in ecosystem metabolism was investigated through continued open-system diel O₂ measurements as well as through episodic benthic and pelagic incubations in 3 main sites in the inner part of Roskilde Fjord from April (spring) to December (winter) 2015 (Fig. 1, Table 1). Two of the sites were located at 2 to 3 m depth, one representing an eelgrass meadow ('eelgrass') and another, approximately 100 m to the south, representing a neighboring, non-eelgrass site. The latter is referred to as the 'bare' site, although the site had scattered small stones (5 to 10 cm in diameter) covered by filamentous algae. The third site ('muddy') represented the deeper (5 m) area characterized by fluffy, organic-rich sediment with no benthic vegetation. In our study, we distinguish between eelgrass-dominated vs. bare vs. muddominated areas and refer to these as different



Fig. 1. Study sites in Roskilde Fjord, Denmark. Investigations were performed in 2 areas of the inner fjord, with Stn 60 representing the deeper (5 m) muddy (mud) area, and the shallower (2 to 3 m) experimental area (Exp) representing a vegetated (eelgrass) and a non-vegetated (bare) site. The color scale in the central figure is a model estimate of the cover (0 to 100%) of eelgrass plants (Mohn et al. 2015)

Table 1. Overview of sampling program and subsequent modelling. Study sites are shown in Fig. 1

Study component	Study sites	Study period				
Water quality sampling	Muddy	May–Dec 2015				
Metabolic rates: seasonal study						
Diel O ₂ measurements (open)	Muddy, eelgrass, bare	Apr-Dec 2015				
Benthic incubations	Eelgrass, bare	3 occasions: Apr, Jun, Aug 2015				
Pelagic incubations	Muddy	14 occasions: Apr–Dec 2015				
Metabolic rates: short-term study						
Diel O ₂ measurements (open)	Depth gradient across habitat types	26 Apr–20 May 2016				
modening of metabolic rates	bare	Jan-Dec				

habitats due to their marked differences in substrate and vegetation. Furthermore, to quantify short-term effects of physical forcing, we conducted a gradient study in May 2016 along a transect perpendicular to the shoreline (from ~100 to 500 m off the shore) starting at 1.8 m and reaching ~5 m depth, representing all 3 habitat types (Table 1, Fig. 1).

Water quality sampling

Water quality sampling for measurements of total and dissolved inorganic nutrients, phytoplankton biomass (chlorophyll *a*; chl *a*), Secchi depth and profiles of temperature, salinity and oxygen was carried out every 2 wk from May to December 2015 at the muddy station, which coincided with a monitoring site (Fig. 1; Stn 60) within the Danish National Aquatic Monitoring and Assessment Program (DNA-MAP). Sampling and measurements of dissolved inorganic nitrogen (DIN; NO₃⁻ + NO₂⁻ + NH₄⁺), dissolved inorganic phosphorus (DIP; PO_4^{3-}) and chl a followed standard technical guidelines (Kaas & Markager 1998). Water column concentrations of nutrients were measured at 1 m depth by colorimetric methods (Danish Standards Association 1975, 1985). Chl a was analyzed from Whatman GF/F or GF 75 Advantec filtered samples from 1 m depths and extracted in ethanol according to Strickland & Parsons (1972). To supplement these monitoring data, water samples were taken from 1 m depth on a bi-weekly to monthly basis to measure pelagic GPP using a modified oxygen incubation technique as described below.

Field measurements of metabolic rates and physical forcing

Diel oxygen measurements

Rates of GPP, *R* and NEP were determined from changes in the concentration of dissolved oxygen (DO) following the diel oxygen technique as originally described by Odum (1956). In our study, continuous measurements (every 10 min) of DO and water temperature were made with miniDOT oxygen optode loggers (Precision Measurement Engineering), (hereafter termed 'oxygen logger') at the 3 main sites. Photosynthetically active radiation (PAR) was measured simultaneously at the same

frequency using 4 Odyssey PAR loggers (Dataflow Systems) (henceforth termed 'PAR loggers') placed within a 2 m depth range at all 3 sites (Fig. 2C). Odyssey loggers were calibrated based on parallel measurements of PAR by a LICOR[®] 2π sensor. All sensors were cleaned on a bi-weekly basis to reduce sensor drift from fouling. Fouling of sensors was further reduced by a copper mesh for the oxygen sensors and by a copper film placed around the light sensors. Sensor drift was corrected by assuming a linear decline in sensitivity over each bi-weekly period.

From April to December 2015, we applied 2 oxygen loggers and a PAR logger at each site (Table 1). At the deeper muddy site, oxygen loggers were attached to a surface buoy approximately 1 m below the sea surface, while at the shallow sites, sensors were fixed to metal poles secured firmly into the sediment, measuring approximately 30 cm above the seafloor. We did not anticipate any effects of sonde placement above sediment, as the water column was fully mixed at all 3 sites throughout the measurement period. At each site, we calculated the diffuse light attenuation coefficient (K_{PAR}) as the linear slope between depth and the log of light intensity. Regressions with a poorer fit ($r^2 < 0.8$) were excluded from further analysis.

The supplementary short-term study of diel O_2 variability represented a 4 wk period from 26 April to 20 May 2016 (Table 1), we deployed 5 oxygen loggers and 1 YSI 6600V2® multisonde measuring oxygen, temperature, water level and salinity. The equipment was placed along a depth gradient from 1.8 m inside the eelgrass meadow extending approximately 500 m perpendicular to the shoreline, northwest towards the muddy site at 5 m depth. All sensors

were attached to metal poles and positioned $\sim 30~{\rm cm}$ above the sediment surface.

Benthic incubations

To investigate the importance of eelgrass meadows and other benthic components for diel variations in oxygen concentrations and daily water column net fluxes, we used in situ chambers, which allowed us to incubate a section of the seafloor with its benthic community. Triplicate chamber incubations were done at the 3 types of habitats in April (spring), June (early summer) and August (mid/late summer) 2015, corresponding to mean temperatures of 9, 16 and 21°C, respectively. Chambers consisted of gasimpermeable transparent plastic bags (19 × 42 cm; diameter × height = 12 l) attached to a hard PVC collar which was secured firmly into the sediment with metal plugs (Fig. 2A). Incubations were made over a period of approximately 24 h with logging of oxygen, temperature and light every 10 min by an oxygen logger and a light logger placed at a depth of about 30 cm above the seafloor inside each chamber fixed to a metal stick placed into the sediment.

Pelagic incubations

Water samples were collected on 14 occasions from April to December at 1 to 2 m depth at the deeper muddy site. These pelagic rates were assumed to also represent pelagic rates at the shallower bare and eelgrass sites. Triplicate measurements of pelagic metabolism were done by *in situ* incubation of the sampled water in 0.5 l transparent glass jars (Fig. 2B) attached to a buoy over approximate 24 h at 1 m depth. An oxygen logger was inserted 5 cm into each glass jar and recorded oxygen and temperature every 10 min. Next to these jars, a PAR logger recorded light simultaneously within the same frequency.

Modelling of oxygen fluxes

To improve comparisons of metabolic rates between open-water and chamber measurements, we applied a similar inverse modelling approach (Hanson et al. 2008, Brighenti et al. 2015) which utilizes data on irradiance and temperature to model metabolic rates from high-frequency oxygen measurements. This approach has less assumptions regarding constant R and facilitated more realistic daily rates using information on the ambient light and temperature conditions during similar periods. This approach also minimizes a possible mismatch between openwater and chamber fluxes that may result from differences in light and temperature conditions during sampling.

Diel changes in DO for open-water measurements, pelagic bottle incubations and benthic chambers were modelled using Eq. (1):

$$DO_{t+1} = DO_t + GPP_t - R_t + F_t$$
(1)

where DO_{t+1} and DO_t are the DO concentrations (mg l^{-1}) at discrete times t + 1 and t with 10 min resolution; GPP_t is GPP at time t; R_t is the ecosystem R at time t (see Eq. 2); and F_t is the net exchange of O_2 between the lake and the atmosphere at time t (Eq. 3). For bottle and chamber incubations with no air–water gas



Fig. 2. Techniques applied to measure metabolic rates in different habitats: (A) *in situ* chamber for benthic oxygen fluxes,(B) bottle incubations for pelagic primary production and respiration rates and (C) buoy with oxygen sensor at the open-water muddy site (Stn 60)

exchange, Eq. (1) was simplified by removing the F_t term. NEP was calculated using a light- and temperature-dependent model (Eq. 2) described by Brighenti et al. (2015):

$$\Delta DO_{t+1} = NEP_{hr} = P_{max} \times \tanh(\alpha \times I_t / P_{max}) - R_{20} \times 1.07^{T_w - 20}$$
(2)

where P_{max} is the light saturation point, α is the initial linear slope of the photosynthesis vs. light relationship describing the average rate of photosynthesis per unit of PAR and I_t is the surface PAR (µmol photons m⁻² s⁻¹) measured at time *t*. Respiration was a function of the rate of *R* at 20°C, water temperature (T_w) and a temperature sensitivity constant equal to 1.07.

Net oxygen exchange between air and water was calculated according to Staehr et al. (2010):

$$F_t = [k_t (DO_t - DO_{sat[t]}) / Z] / 2$$
 (3)

where DO is the measured concentration in the water and $DO_{sat[t]}$ is the concentration in water at equilibrium with the atmosphere at ambient temperature and pressure (Weiss 1970) at time t, k_t is the coefficient of gas exchange for DO at time t and Z is the total depth of the water column at the measurement site. The value of k was calculated based on the relationship among Schmidt numbers (*Sc*) and temperature (Jähne et al. 1987): $k = k_{600} \times (Sc / 600)^{-0.5}$, where k_{600} is the piston velocity calculated as function of wind speed at 10 m height according to a model developed for Roskilde Fjord (Mørk et al. 2014). Wind speeds were measured at a meteorology mast 1 km away from the experimental area.

The 3 parameters in Eq. (2) (P_{max} , α and R_{max}) were estimated using a conjugate-gradient optimization algorithm that minimized the sum of squared errors between estimated and observed DO for each incubation period with constraints on the parameter space, i.e. lower and upper bound for each parameter. The parameters P_{max} , α , and R_{max} were finally used to estimate DO concentrations at every 10 min using Eq. (1) above. Parameterization of DO curves can be poor on days where oxygen dynamics are dominated by physical exchanges (Hanson et al. 2008). To assess model performance (i.e. how well the model fitted the observed DO data), we determined the coefficient of determination (r²). To reduce bias by erroneously modelled DO curves, we removed sonde days with r^2 below 0.2 (Obrador et al. 2014), resulting in removal of 15% of the 1068 sonde days measured in total.

The optimized parameters P_{max} , α and R_{max} were subsequently used to calculate hourly rates of NEP,

GPP and *R*, inserting 10 min interval recordings of the mean available light in the water column and water temperature over a 24 h period. Mean light availability (E_{mean}) for primary producers (i.e. the expected value of PAR to which an algal cell is exposed, assuming that the water column is fully mixed) was calculated according to Staehr & Sand-Jensen (2007):

$$E_{\text{mean}} = E_0 \left(1 - e^{-K_{\text{PAR}}Z} \right) / \left(K_{\text{PAR}}Z \right)$$
(4)

where K_{PAR} is the diffuse PAR attenuation coefficient (m⁻¹), *Z* is the total depth of the water column, and E_0 is the surface PAR (µmol photon m⁻² s⁻¹) measured at the nearby (1 km) meteorological mast.

Daily rates of GPP, NEP and *R* were calculated as the average hourly rates (over 24 h) multiplied by 24 h. Volumetric daily rates were then converted to area-specific rates. For open-water measurements and bottle incubations, this simply involved multiplying volumetric rates (g $O_2 m^{-3} d^{-1}$) with the depth (m) of the water column at the measurement site. For benthic chamber incubations, this conversion involved multiplying with the volume (12 l on average) of the incubation bags and dividing by the area (0.028 m²) of the incubation chambers. We display *R* as negative values to facilitate rate comparison.

Statistical analysis

To enable a comparison of open-water (total), pelagic and benthic estimates of GPP, R and NEP, we applied a general linear mixed model (GLMM) describing spatial variation among habitats and seasonal (at a monthly resolution) variation as fixed factors, and variation among sampling days within months as random factors in addition to residual variation. Since data on metabolic rates were not consistently measured throughout the entire study period for all 3 habitats (muddy, bare and eelgrass), marginal means were calculated from the GLMM to produce comparable means for spatial and seasonal variation. The significance of the fixed effects in the GLMM was tested using an F-test for the additional variation explained by the given factor, i.e. comparing the models with and without the factor. Tests for differences in metabolic rates among habitats were performed as contrasts between parameter estimates. The GLMM was analyzed using PROC MIXED in SAS v.9.3. Furthermore, the short-term temporal variability in GPP, R and NEP for the open-water estimates was estimated by calculating the standard deviation of the residuals between observations and a 15 d moving average across the entire study period. Statistical investigation of relationships between variables was performed using a simple Spearman ranks correlation analysis on the untransformed data. Finally, to evaluate the level of background R (sensu Solomon et al. 2013) associated with particulate and dissolved organic matter, we performed a linear regression model of R as a function of GPP (using geometric means) and estimated the background R level as the *y*-intercept.

RESULTS

Seasonal changes in physical and chemical conditions

Depth profiles showed that the water column was fully mixed from April to December with similar temperature and salinity (data not shown) at surface and bottom at the deeper muddy station (Fig. 3A). Daily surface irradiance showed large day-to-day variation and peaked around the equinox in late June, approximately 2 mo before the peak of water temperatures (Fig. 3A). Daily wind speeds averaged 4.4 m s⁻¹ (range: 1.2 to 9.7 m s⁻¹), with 47% of days having wind speeds <4 m s⁻¹ and only 2% having wind speeds >8 m s⁻¹ (Fig. 3B). Chl *a* levels were overall low (range: 0.9 to 8.9 µg l⁻¹) and Secchi depths relatively high (range: 3.2 to 5.1 m ~ visible at bottom), considering the rather high nutrient levels (Fig. 3C). Secchi depth was strongly related to chl a ($r_s = -0.54$, p = 0.008). Chl *a* peaked in late April indicating a late spring bloom (Fig. 3C) with a corresponding drawdown of DIN. Nitrogen remained almost completely depleted until late August when a small increase occurred (Fig. 3D). Following a phytoplankton bloom in September (Fig. 3C), DIN levels declined. During the DIN-depleted summer period, DIP increased, followed by decreasing concentrations in late autumn as DIN accumulated (Fig. 3D).

Temporal pattern of ecosystem metabolism in different habitats

All 3 habitats exhibited a clear seasonality in open-water estimates of GPP, NEP, and R (Fig. 4, Table 2). GPP and R increased during spring, reaching maximum in late summer and declining in fall and winter (Fig. 4). GPP increased more strongly with water temperatures and solar radiation than R (Table 3). While GPP seemed unrelated to wind at



Fig. 3. Seasonal changes in (A) daily water temperature at 1 and 4 m depth and surface irradiance (PAR), (B) daily wind speed 10 m above sea level, (C) Secchi depth and chl *a* (biweekly) and (D) dissolved inorganic phosphorus (DIP) and nitrogen (DIN) (bi-weekly)

the deepest site, there was a significant correlation between *R* and wind speeds for all 3 habitats. In combination, these relationships indicate that net autotrophy (NEP > 0) prevailed during warm, sunny and calm periods (Table 3). *R* was weakly correlated with GPP in the 2 shallow habitats ($r_s = 0.34$, p < 0.001) compared to a stronger correlation in the muddy habitat ($r_s = 0.63$, p < 0.001). Regression analysis of open-water *R* vs. GPP showed that background *R* was very low, as it was not significantly different from zero (Student's *t*-test, p > 0.05) in any of the habitats.



Fig. 4. Daily estimates of gross primary production (GPP), respiration (R) and net ecosystem production (NEP) determined from continuous oxygen measurements in 2 shallow (2 to 3 m) sites dominated by (A) eelgrass and (B) bare sediments, and (C) in the deeper (5 m) muddy site in Roskilde Fjord, Denmark (April to December 2015). R is presented as a negative number to facilitate plotting on the same graph as GPP and NEP. Negative NEP values are days when R outpaces GPP. Solid lines are 14 d moving averages. (D) Mean (±95 % CI) GPP, R and NEP for the 3 sites over the study

There were overall significant differences in openwater metabolic rates among the 3 habitats (Table 2). Areal GPP was significantly lower in the deeper muddy habitat (mean \pm 95 % CI: 4.60 \pm 0.59 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) compared to the eelgrass (5.26 ± 0.23 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) and bare habitats (5.40 ± 0.23 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹). Area R was slightly higher in the bare habitat (5.13 ± 0.33 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) compared to the eelgrass (4.71 ± 0.32 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) and muddy habitats (4.84 ± 0.66 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹). The metabolic balance (NEP = GPP – R) was overall positive for the eelgrass (0.54 ± 0.36 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) and bare habitats (0.31 ± 0.36 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) but negative for the muddy habitat (-0.26 ± 0.64 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹), supporting expectations of net autotrophy in the nonvegetated deeper muddy area.

Days of net heterotrophy (NEP < 0) occurred during all months for all 3 habitats (Fig. 4), but were slightly more frequent at the muddy site (48%) compared to the shallower sites (44%). While negative NEP occurred in all months, the shallow sites mostly experienced net heterotrophy during autumn, suggesting a significant loss of autotrophic biomass here. The analysis of residuals from the 15 d moving average trend showed higher day-to-day variability in open-water metabolic rates in the muddy habitat, especially for GPP and R (cf. Fig. 4). Standard deviations of the residuals from the muddy habitat were 2.71, 2.67 and 2.74 g O_2 m⁻² d⁻¹ for GPP, *R* and NEP. In comparison, standard deviations of the residuals in the bare habitat were 1.63, 2.43 and 2.63 g $O_2 m^{-2} d^{-1}$, almost similar to those of the eelgrass habitat (1.65, 2.30 and 2.50 g O_2 m⁻² d⁻¹ for GPP, *R* and NEP, respectively).

Contribution of pelagic and benthic habitats to ecosystem integrated rates

Based on the bottle incubations, we determined areal-specific rates of pelagic GPP, *R* and NEP, which were much lower than rates obtained with the openwater measurements and the benthic chamber incubations (Fig. 5). Pelagic GPP for the entire period (April to December) was on average 2.0 g $O_2 m^{-2} d^{-1}$, compared to pelagic *R* of 1.6 g $O_2 m^{-2} d^{-1}$, indicating that the water column was overall net autotrophic (0.4 g $O_2 m^{-2} d^{-1}$). Pelagic GPP estimates suggested moderate seasonal variation in productivity (Fig. 6), although the statistical test showed no significant difference between months (Table 2).

Benthic GPP and *R*, measured in benthic incubation chambers, was overall much higher in the eelgrass beds compared to the nearby shallow bare sediment and the deeper muddy site (Table 4). The eelgrass site was the only habitat with a net positive flux of oxygen (NEP > 0) from the sediment to the water column (Table 4). Low metabolic rates in the eelgrass habitat

Table 2. General linear mixed model (GLMM) results for effects of habitats and seasons on differences in total (open-water), pelagic and benthic (chamber) GPP, R and NEP. Significant levels (p < 0.05) effects are highlighted in **bold**. Degrees of freedom (df) for the numerator (Num) and the denominator (Den) along with the *F*-values are shown

Туре	Variable	Effect	Num df	Den df	F	р
Total	GPP	Habitat	2	387	7.4	< 0.001
		Month	7	219	25.6	< 0.001
		Habitat × month	14	387	1.1	0.352
	R	Habitat	2	381	4.5	0.011
		Month	7	219	7.3	< 0.001
		Habitat × month	14	381	1.2	0.244
	NEP	Habitat	2	381	4.4	0.013
		Month	7	219	3.6	< 0.001
		Habitat × month	14	381	1.4	0.155
Pelagic	GPP	Month	6	7	2.0	0.187
0	R	Month	6	7	1.1	0.463
	NEP	Month	6	7	1.3	0.369
Benthic	GPP	Month	2	14	30.1	< 0.001
		Habitat	2	14	47.6	< 0.001
		Month × habitat	3	14	13.7	< 0.001
	R	Month	2	14	12.8	0.001
		Habitat	2	14	15.3	< 0.001
		Month × habitat	3	14	2.9	0.072
	NEP	Month	2	14	13.2	0.001
		Habitat	2	14	4.0	0.043
		Month × habitat	3	14	4.2	0.026

Table 3. Daily values of water temperature (T_w), surface irradiance (PAR), wind speed at 10 m (wind), GPP, R and NEP at the shallow eelgrass site (eelgrass) and non-eelgrass site (bare) and the central, deeper Stn 60 (muddy) habitat. The Spearman rank correlation coefficient (r_s) is shown with the significance levels (p)

Habitat	Parameter		GPP —		R		NEP ——
		r _s	р	r _s	р	r _s	р
Eelgrass	T _w PAR Wind	0.61 0.53 -0.08	<0.0001 <0.0001 0.2491	0.28 0.15 0.15	<0.0001 0.0235 0.0224	0.32 0.34 -0.18	<0.0001 <0.0001 0.0067
Bare	$T_{ m w}$ PAR Wind	0.65 0.52 -0.10	<0.0001 <0.0001 0.1362	0.26 0.09 0.29	<0.0001 0.1775 <0.0001	0.30 0.36 -0.36	<0.0001 <0.0001 <0.0001
Mud	$T_{ m w}$ PAR Wind	0.46 0.54 -0.08	<0.0001 <0.0001 0.3125	0.39 0.20 0.25	<0.0001 0.006 0.0006	0.17 0.48 -0.36	0.0187 <0.0001 <0.0001

in April were measured during strong winds (>8 m s⁻¹), low irradiance and highly turbid cold water, possibly explaining the much lower rates compared to other months (Fig. 6). Benthic rates of both GPP, R and NEP all showed significant seasonal variation with significant differences among the 3 sites (Table 3). For GPP and NEP, there was significant interaction between habitats and seasons, indicating that seasonal variation differed among habitats.

Comparing open-water (~total) seasonal average estimates of GPP, R and NEP with estimates based on in situ benthic chambers (~benthic) and bottle incubations (~pelagic), showed a close (~100%) agreement between total and the sum of benthic + pelagic rates for the shallow eelgrass site (Fig. 5). Interestingly, although the bare shallow site had total metabolic rates very similar to the nearby eelgrass site, the sum of the measured benthic and pelagic rates could only account for 37% of the open-water GPP estimates and 54% of the ecosystem R measured at the bare site (Fig. 5). A similar discrepancy was found for the muddy site where the sum of benthic and pelagic metabolic rates only accounted for 46 and 47% of open-water GPP and R, respectively. This discrepancy between open-water and chamber-based rates for the bare and muddy sites seemed connected to the substantially lower benthic rates measured in these habitats, compared to the eelgrass-dominated habitat where benthic rates were multifold higher (Fig. 5). However, integrating across all months and habitats with the GLMM, total GPP, R and NEP were only approximately 10% higher than the sum of pelagic and benthic rates, suggesting a relatively good agreement between estimated rates. While pelagic and benthic processes showed different seasonality, their overall contribution to total rates were similar, with 54, 56 and 46% of GPP, R and NEP, respectively, accounted for by benthic processes.

Changes in metabolic rates with depth and wind conditions

Deploying an array of oxygen, light and temperature loggers for 4 wk from the near-shore shallow (1.8 m) to the deeper central site (5 m) enabled us to calculate daily GPP, R and NEP along a depth gradient (Fig. 7). Although volumetric rates were 3-fold higher at the shallow sites, water-column integrated rates were



Fig. 5. Comparison of GPP, R and NEP mean rates for the 3 studied habitats in Roskilde Fjord obtained from open-water oxygen measurements representing total rates, and bottle incubations representing pelagic rates and benthic chamber rates. Means represent April to November for total rates, April to September and December for pelagic rates, and April, June and August for benthic rates. Error bars: $\pm 95\%$ CI of the means

more similar along the gradient. Nevertheless, shallow sites had almost twice as high areal GPP and R, with small, albeit positive and significant, NEP compared to NEP ~ 0 at the deeper sites.

As 2 of our oxygen loggers in the 3 to 4 m depth interval malfunctioned, our characterization of the depth gradient was not as detailed as planned. Aggregating data into a nearshore (1.8 to 2.1 m depth) and deep (4.1 to 5 m depth) area allowed us to investigate the importance of short-term wind and water movement events for diel changes in oxygen and the derived daily rates of ecosystem metabolism at contrasting depths (Fig. 8). During the 4 wk measurement campaign, considerable variation in wind speed, wind direction, water level and surface light was observed. The relatively long, narrow and shallow hydromorphology of the estuary, oriented in a south-north direction (Fig. 1), makes water level in the inner part sensitive to northerly winds, forcing water from the outer broad into the shallow inner broad, where our study was carried out. This wind-driven increase in water level was clearly observed on 3 occasions during our measurement campaign, and the increases in water levels scaled with the duration and strength of northerly winds (Fig. 8A,B). In the first event, relatively weak northerly winds (4 to 5 m s^{-1}) only persisted for 2 d, causing a water level rise of 0.3 m (Fig. 8A,B). The second event lasted for 3 d with similarly weak winds, causing a water level rise of 0.4 m. The last event lasted 5 d, but with winds ranging between 6 to 12 m s⁻¹, resulting in a water level rise of 0.5 m lasting for 3 d (Fig. 8A,B). During this last event, observed in situ light levels dropped considerably. Although these meteorological events were short-lived, they had marked effects on the variability and magnitude of DO at the shallow sites (Fig. 8C). Large daily variability in oxygen ranging from 80 to 200% saturation were immediately reduced to variations similar to the deeper offshore sites, with diel oxygen variations ranging between 80 and 110% saturation (Fig. 8C). Consequently, daily GPP was lower on days with reduced oxygen dynamics, with the duration and strength of the wind-driven water movements driving rates down (Fig. 8D). This indirect effect of wind on apparent ecosystem productivity was also evident when plotting GPP and NEP against daily mean levels of wind speed (Fig. 9). While productivity at the deeper sites appeared to be unaffected by wind conditions, winds had a significant negative effect on both apparent GPP and NEP at the shallow sites becoming net heterotrophic at winds above 8 m s^{-1} .

DISCUSSION

This study provides a direct comparison of integrated ecosystem metabolism rates in 3 functionally different habitats within a temperate shallow estuary. Seasonal application of the diel oxygen technique in combination with incubations of benthic vs. pelagic compartments at different depths furthermore enabled us to evaluate conditions affecting temporal variability along a depth gradient and to quantify the relative importance of benthic and pelagic compartments.



Fig. 6. Monthly means of pelagic, benthic and open-water (total) GPP, *R* and NEP in Roskilde Fjord estimated from the general linear mixed model (GLMM). Means represent an average of the 3 habitats; error bars show the 95% CI of the mean values. Benthic rates marked with hatched bars were calculated as the difference between total and pelagic rates

Table 4. In situ determined benthic rates (g $O_2 m^{-2} d^{-1}$) of GPP, *R* and NEP for 3 different habitats (eelgrass, bare sediment and muddy sediment) in Roskilde Fjord. Values are means of triplicates \pm SD; nd: no data

Habitat	Process	April	June	August
Eelgrass	GPP	0.4 ± 0.5	8.8 ± 2.6	3.5 ± 1.8
	NEP	0.2 ± 0.4	2.1 ± 1.5	-1.6 ± 4.2
	<i>R</i>	-0.2 ± 0.1	-6.7 ± 2.2	-5.1 ± 5.5
Bare	GPP	0.3 ± 0.9	1.7 ± 0.8	1.7 ± 3.7
	NEP	-0.2 ± 0.4	-0.4 ± 0.7	-2.4 ± 2.6
	<i>R</i>	-0.5 ± 0.6	-2.1 ± 1.4	-4.0 ± 5.0
Muddy	GPP	nd	1.0 ± 2.4	0.3 ± 0.7
	NEP	nd	-1.0 \pm 1.6	-1.4 ± 1.4
	<i>R</i>	nd	-2.0 \pm 1.4	-1.8 ± 2.1

Temporal variability in open-water metabolic rates

Our modelled ecosystem metabolism from continuous oxygen measurements showed large variations in GPP, R and NEP on a daily basis and across seasons and habitats. The magnitude and temporal variability in open-water metabolic rates resembled those found for North American estuaries (Caffrey 2004). Similar to Caffrey (2004), we found that the balance between GPP and R was largely determined by the habitat type. Accordingly, our shallow sites inside or just outside the eelgrass meadows were significantly more net autotrophic compared to the more net heterotrophic, deeper muddy site with greater dominance of pelagic processes. As observed in other studies in shallow estuaries and lakes, our daily NEP estimates indicated large shifts from net autotrophy to net heterotrophy over both seasonal (monthly) and even daily time scales (e.g. Staehr & Sand-Jensen 2007, Kemp & Testa 2011). At the central deeper station, there was a general pattern of spring net autotrophy transitioning to summer heterotrophy, consistent with a longterm analysis of net oxygen exchanges in Roskilde Fjord (Staehr et al. 2017). In comparison, the shallow sites showed less seasonality in NEP, remaining



Fig. 7. Differences in GPP, *R* and NEP rates across a shallow depth gradient in Roskilde Fjord. Rates are means over 24 d with 95 % CI



Fig. 8. Time series of (A) wind speed and direction, (B) water level and surface light, (C) oxygen saturation level and (D) GPP during a 4 wk spring period in Roskilde Fjord. In (C) and (D), the shallow (1.8 to 2.1 m) and deeper (4.1 to 5 m) part of the estuary are contrasted, using data from the transect investigation. Shaded areas highlight periods with changes in water level related to changing wind speed and direction

mostly positive throughout the year, although with a clear drop in productivity during late autumn when light and temperature decreased and storm-related loss of vegetation occurred. Our residual analysis showed that day-to-day variability was clearly larger at the central pelagic-dominated station for both GPP and *R*, and to a lesser extent for NEP. This suggests that deeper stations dominated by pelagic processes and with stronger light limitation are more sensitive to changes in nutrient conditions and incoming light.

Ecosystem integrated metabolic rates

Across the 3 investigated habitats, summer (June through August) mean daily rates of GPP in Roskilde Fjord (mean \pm SE: 7.0 \pm 0.3 mg O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) were slightly lower than those reported by Hoellein et al. (2013) for a large range of estuaries across the Northern Hemisphere (~10 \pm 1 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹). Interestingly, R in Roskilde Fjord was less than half (6.0 \pm 0.3 g O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) of those reported by Hoellein et al. (2013): ~14 \pm 1 g $O_2\ m^{-2}\ d^{-1}.$ Thus, where many estuaries display strong net heterotrophy, even during summer, Roskilde Fjord is overall net autotrophic $(1.0 \pm 0.3 \text{ g } \text{O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1})$ in agreement with a small subset of shallow densely vegetated estuaries around the USA (Caffrey 2004) and Chesapeake Bay tributaries (Kemp & Testa 2011). Our results are similar to those of Hume et al. (2011), who applied the eddy correlation technique to measure productivity during summer (June and July), reporting NEP in vegetated shallow areas of $0.6 \text{ g } \text{O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$.

Using a molar O_2 :C quotient of 1, and using a simple polynomial model (Laas et al. 2012) to extend the measured GPP period (April to December) to cover the entire year, Roskilde Fjord had an annual GPP ranging between 575 and 663 g C m⁻² yr⁻¹ across the muddy and eelgrass habitats. These values are in the high end of the spectrum compared to GPP values reported by Borum & Sand-Jensen (1996) for 34 coastal systems (median: 346; range: 28 to 820 g C m⁻² yr⁻¹) and the

nearby Limfjorden where GPP was estimated to have reached 350 g C m⁻² yr⁻¹ during pristine conditions (Krause-Jensen et al. 2012). Annual NEP ranged from -35 g C m⁻² yr⁻¹ in the muddy area to 74 g C m⁻² yr⁻¹ in the vegetated area, similar to previous findings by Caffrey (2004) using the open-water oxygen technique (range: -55 to 68 g C m⁻² yr⁻¹) in 5 shallow estuaries dominated by submerged aquatic vegetation. In comparison, net primary production, estimated from net accumulation of plant biomass, may



Fig. 9. Wind speed vs. daily rates of (A) GPP and (B) NEP at shallow (1.8 to 2.1 m) and deeper sites (4.1 to 5 m)

be several times higher within dense beds of perennial macrophytes (Borum & Sand-Jensen 1996). For example, Wium-Andersen & Borum (1984) estimated annual (April to October) net above-ground production of 814 g C m^{-2} yr⁻¹ in a Danish estuary. The significantly lower NEP rates obtained from the openwater oxygen measurements are not surprising as this technique accounts for oxygen production and consumption by both auto- and heterotrophs occupying both benthic and pelagic components (Staehr et al. 2012). In addition, depending on water exchange, the oxygen technique will integrate processes that can easily exceed the area of the densely vegetated macrophyte beds (Hume et al. 2011). In support of this, NEP rates measured within benthic chambers under calm wind conditions (2 to 4 m s^{-1}) in June were up to 4 times higher than NEP rates calculated from parallel open-water oxygen measurements within the dense eelgrass bed.

Importance of benthic and pelagic contributions

To distinguish benthic and pelagic contributions to total areal GPP, R and NEP, we applied 24 h oxygen chamber incubations and compared these with daily rates calculated from open-water oxygen measurements. The analytical approach was essentially the same for benthic, pelagic and open-water measurements, with the modification that incubations did not account for air-water gas exchange.

Pelagic rates of metabolism measured in this study were similar to rates reported by Mantikci (2014) for the central part of Roskilde Fjord, where a combination of ¹⁴C and oxygen incubation techniques was used. Converting rates by Mantikci (2014) using a molar O₂:C quotient of 1, GPP ranged between 0.3 and 5.3 mg $O_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$; R between 0.3 and 3.2 mg O_2 $m^{-2} d^{-1}$ and NEP between 0.1 and 3.5 mg $O_2 m^{-2} d^{-1}$. These levels are consistent with those reported here (Fig. 6), and both studies report similar seasonality with peaks in June and July. Oxygen fluxes across the water-sediment interface were measured in light and dark incubations of sediment cores as part of the DNAMAP, including Stn 60 in Roskilde Fjord (Dalsgaard 2003). Dalsgaard (2003) reported seasonal ranges in GPP from 0.1 to 1.5 g O_2 m⁻² d⁻¹; R from 0.3 to 2.0 g O_2 m⁻² d⁻¹ and NEP from -0.7 to 0.5 g O_2 m⁻² d⁻¹. These levels resemble those measured for the muddy station (Table 4), with monthly variation mirroring that of water temperature (Fig. 6). Thus, pelagic and benthic rates reported in this study have similar levels and temporal variability as those previously reported.

Comparing open-water (total) rates with pelagic and benthic incubations demonstrated that benthic metabolism is important and often dominating in shallow coastal environments. This was particularly prominent in the eelgrass area where the benthic habitat alone accounted for approximately 90% of total GPP and *R* and 64 % of NEP. While the unvegetated shallow site had total metabolic rates very similar to the nearby eelgrass site, the sum of the measured benthic and pelagic rates could only account for 37 % of the open-water GPP estimates and 54 % of R(Fig. 5). An even greater discrepancy between total and the sum of pelagic and benthic rates was found for the muddy site. We attribute this difference to the metabolic footprint of the eelgrass meadow markedly exceeding beyond the confines of the meadow, thereby supplying oxygen to the neighboring unvegetated site as well as the deeper central sites. We interpret the observed systematic differences in metabolism between areas differing substantially in substrate conditions and vegetation cover mainly as differences between different habitats, rather than just spatial differences related to factors such as differences in water depth. This terminology agrees with Caffrey (2004), who also categorized her sites based on the dominant habitat adjacent to the deployment site.

The importance of benthic processes was not surprising given the shallowness of the estuary and its relatively clear waters, providing sufficient light at the sediment surface to support benthic primary production throughout the studied areas. Previous evaluations of the benthic versus pelagic contribution to the inner part of Roskilde Fjord suggested that phytoplankton contributed between 100 and 62% of total areal GPP (Borum & Sand-Jensen 1996). However, water quality has improved significantly since the 1990s, especially in the inner parts of the estuary (Staehr et al. 2017). Accordingly, chl a has decreased by 50% and Secchi depth has increased by approximately 1 m, enabling eelgrass to expand from 2 to 2.6 m depth, and the improved light environment has likely stimulated the growth of benthic algal communities (Sand-Jensen & Borum 1991, Staehr et al. 2017). It is therefore plausible that the benthic compartment now plays a much larger role compared to the 1990s. This change should render the system more autotrophic and a greater sink for carbon and nutrients (McGlathery et al. 2007, Fourqurean et al. 2012) stored in the sediments by accumulation of slowly degradable roots and rhizomes and allochthonous organic matter trapped by the seagrasses (Kennedy et al. 2010, Duarte et al. 2013).

Depth gradients in metabolic rates

Shallow areas dominated by benthic vegetation maintaining large standing carbon stocks tend to have a higher NEP compared to deeper waters dominated by phytoplankton of lower standing stocks (e.g. Caffrey et al. 1998, Nixon et al. 2001, Caffrey 2004). In agreement with this, we observed a clear trend with decreasing GPP, R and NEP from the shallow sites toward the central deeper habitat. Differences in metabolic rates among the 3 investigated areas were much more pronounced when comparing volumetric rates (rather than areal rates), which for GPP were 2.5-fold lower at the muddy deeper site compared to the 2 shallow sites, thus reflecting that the same area-specific production was concentrated in a smaller volume at the shallow sites with benthic dominance. Similar conclusions were made by Odum (1967), who found a clear declining trend in oxygen concentration with increasing depth, reflecting higher metabolic rates (on a volumetric basis) in shallower waters where temperatures are higher and plant pigments are more concentrated (Kemp & Testa 2011). It is a general feature that the compression of the photic zone from several meters in phytoplankton

communities to centimeters in macrophyte stands to millimeters scale in dense microalgal mats is paralleled by a marked increase in volumetric photosynthesis while areal photosynthesis remains remarkably constant (Krause-Jensen & Sand-Jensen 1998). The observed shift from positive towards negative NEP with increasing depth and distance from the shore also supports the concept that non-advective physical processes drive a net transport of organic matter from shallow to deeper areas (Kemp et al. 1997, Van de Bogert et al. 2007).

While gradients in metabolic rates were observed with increasing depth and distance from the dense eelgrass meadows, habitat differences were less obvious in the data set covering a temporal range from April to December. As an example, the shallow eelgrass and bare (~unvegetated) areas had almost identical magnitude and seasonality in GPP, R and NEP, despite the much lower benthic rates measured here. The discrepancy between total rates and the sum of benthic and pelagic rates in the bare habitat suggests that open-water rates measured in this habitat were strongly affected by excess oxygen produced in the nearby dense eelgrass meadow. Although the muddy central site had a comparable higher pelagic contribution, there was also a discrepancy between total rates and incubations here, suggesting that the oxygen spillover effect from dense eelgrass beds can be an important feature affecting oxygen dynamics in an area that far exceeds the local meadow.

Importance of environmental conditions for temporal variability in metabolic rates

Despite the observed differences in day-to-day variability of metabolic rates among the shallow and deeper areas, they displayed similar temporal variation and magnitude in open-water metabolic rates, having quite similar responses to abiotic conditions in terms of increasing net autotrophy during calm, warm and sunny periods. Similar temporal variation and relationships with meteorological drivers characterize productive temperate lake ecosystems (Staehr & Sand-Jensen 2007, Staehr et al. 2010, Laas et al. 2012). Other studies of estuarine ecosystem metabolism have, however, reported weak relationships between NEP and prevailing temperature (negative), light (positive) and wind (negative) conditions (Caffrey 2004, Hoellein et al. 2013, Murrell et al. 2018). Studies of GPP, R and NEP using the eddy correlation technique have reported substantial day-to-day variability strongly coupled to variations in light and hydrodynamic conditions (Hume et al. 2011, Lee et al. 2017). Based on the eddy correlation technique, which takes into account the lateral exchange of oxygen, significant differences in metabolic rates have also been identified between a seagrass site and a nearby unvegetated site (Hume et al. 2011). This suggests that the parameterization of diel oxygen changes applied in our study is not sufficiently sensitive to separate such lateral exchanges between neighboring sites. Interestingly, a recent study has shown how the difference between open-water and bottle incubations of DO can be used as a proxy of benthic contribution, which in shallow seagrassdominated environments can be important, indicating that the open-water method can capture both water column and benthic processes (Murrell et al. 2018).

Inability of the open-water oxygen technique to account for lateral oxygen exchanges in calculations of metabolic rates likely explains the apparently strong effects of wind observed at the shallow sites (Figs. 8D & 9). The larger diel oxygen excursions at the shallow sites (2 to 3 m) were almost instantly reduced to levels and variations corresponding to those of the deeper sites (4 to 5 m) when wind conditions (wind speed and direction) forced a significant (~20 to 30 cm) shift in water levels. Larger uncertainties in calculated metabolic rates are therefore likely to occur on cold, windy and cloudy days where diel changes in oxygen are mostly governed by physical forcing rather than by biological activity, which our model is insufficient to capture. We therefore excluded those extreme days with poor model performance ($r^2 < 0.2$), which typically represented situations when water levels increased and surface irradiance was low, observed as drops in calculated GPP (and NEP; not shown). Even after excluding days with poor model fit, there was a strong negative effect of wind speed on apparent GPP and NEP (Fig. 8). The choice of models to correct for the effect of wind on the exchange of oxygen across the air-water interface can affect calculated metabolic rates (Marino & Howarth 1993). Sensitivity studies, however, show that this issue is a greater problem in oligotrophic systems, with small diel variations in oxygen concentrations around saturation (Staehr et al. 2010), which was seldom the case in the shallow eelgrass-dominated habitat. Finally, as air-sea exchange is more effective in the surface layers (Wanninkhof et al. 2009), windinduced turbulence has a proportionately larger effect on the metabolic rate calculations in shallow than in deep water (Caffrey 2004). Other studies

have explained the negative effect of wind on metabolic rates as a result of lower light availability, either due to deeper mixing of phytoplankton (e.g. Staehr & Sand-Jensen 2007, Hu et al. 2015), elevated levels of suspended particles (e.g. Arfi et al. 1993) or co-variation with wind and reduced surface light from cloud cover (Fisher et al. 2003). Elevated respiration caused by wind-induced resuspension of labile organic matter from the sediment surface into the water column (Demers et al. 1987) may also reduce NEP (Dokulil 1994). Nevertheless, our results indicate that a significant dilution or spillover effect occurs between adjacent habitats. Except for periods with very limited water movement, it therefore seems appropriate to think of the measured openwater metabolic rates as apparent, rather than absolute rates of local production and respiration. While this is a weakness of the open-water oxygen method for determining site-specific metabolic rates, it supports the use of this technique when aiming to evaluate system-integrated rates across larger heterogeneous areas as compared to compartment specific rates where incubation techniques are preferable (Kemp & Testa 2011, Staehr et al. 2012).

CONCLUSIONS

This study confirms the important functional and biogeochemical role of eelgrass meadows in the coastal systems. Besides their local importance as biologically diverse and productive hotspots, the considerable spillover of oxygen from seagrass meadows to neighboring areas implies an ecological and biogeochemical impact extending beyond their physical coverage. Furthermore, this spillover effect is not limited to oxygen, but concerns other biogeochemically relevant substances as well, such as organic carbon and nutrients. Our study suggests that the extent of this footprint is strongly affected by prevailing wind forcing (Fig. 10), but surface irradiance, local physical characteristics (depth, fetch), sediment characteristics (sediment grain size, organic matter content), density of aquatic vegetation and water quality (Secchi depth and chl a concentration) also modulate this effect. While other methods, such as the eddy correlation technique, are superior in accounting for lateral exchanges, our study shows that open-water oxygen measurements in combination with chamber incubations are well suited to assess the importance of different habitats and environmental conditions for spatio-temporal variability in estuarine metabolism.



Fig. 10. Conceptual diagram for depth gradients in GPP and *R* from shallow nearshore to deeper central parts of Roskilde Fjord, under calm (left) and windy conditions (right). At shallower depths, light conditions favor benthic primary producers such as eelgrass in soft sandy habitats. These plants have higher areal GPP and a net positive oxygen balance. With increasing depth, planktonic and benthic microalgae capable of utilizing the high ambient nutrient levels and relatively high light levels dominate GPP and *R*. Muddy sediments at deeper depths prevent any significant establishment of macrophytes and contribute with high oxygen demand, resulting in negative NEP. Increasing wind efficiently mixes water from deeper areas onto shallow nearshore habitats, containing lower oxygen concentrations and higher levels of suspended matter, thereby reducing water transparency and elevating pelagic oxygen consumption

Acknowledgements. This work was supported by the COCOA project funded under the BONUS program B 'Viable ecosystems' (grant agreement 2112932-1), funded jointly by the EU and the Danish Research Council.

LITERATURE CITED

- Arfi R, Guiral D, Bouvy M (1993) Wind induced resuspension in a shallow tropical lagoon. Estuar Coast Shelf Sci 36:587–604
- Borum J, Sand-Jensen K (1996) Is total primary production in shallow coastal marine waters stimulated by nitrogen loading? Oikos 76:406–410
- Boström C, Baden S, Bockelmann AC, Dromph K and others (2014) Distribution, structure and function of Nordic eelgrass (*Zostera marina*) ecosystems: implications for coastal management and conservation. Aquat Conserv 24: 410–434
- Brighenti LS, Staehr PA, Gagliardi LM, Brandao LPM and others (2015) Seasonal changes in metabolic rates of two tropical lakes in the Atlantic forest of Brazil. Ecosystems 18:589–604
- Caffrey JM (2004) Factors controlling net ecosystem metabolism in US estuaries. Estuaries 27:90–101
- Caffrey JM, Cloern JE, Grenz C (1998) Changes in production and respiration during a spring phytoplankton bloom in San Francisco Bay, California: implications for net ecosystem metabolism. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 172:1–12
- Dalsgaard T (2003) Benthic primary production and nutrient cycling in sediments with benthic microalgae and transient accumulation of macroalgae. Limnol Oceanogr 48: 2138–2150

Danish Standards Association (1975) Determination of nitro-

gen content after oxidation by peroxodisulphate, DS 221. Danish Standards Association, Copenhagen

- Danish Standards Association (1985) Water analysis—total phosphor—photometric method. DS 292. Danish Standards Association, Copenhagen
- ^{*}Demers S, Therriault JC, Bourget E, Bah A (1987) Resuspension in the shallow sublittoral zone of a macrotidal estuarine environment: wind influence. Limnol Oceanogr 32: 327–339
- Dokulil MT (1994) Environmental control of phytoplankton productivity in turbulent turbid systems. Hydrobiologia 289:65–72
- Duarte CM (2017) Reviews and syntheses: hidden forests, the role of vegetated coastal habitats in the ocean carbon budget. Biogeosciences 14:301–310
- Duarte CM, Chiscano CL (1999) Seagrass biomass and production: a reassessment. Aquat Bot 65:159–174
- Duarte CM, Conley DJ, Carstensen J, Sanchez-Camacho M (2009) Return to Neverland: shifting baselines affect eutrophication restoration targets. Estuaries Coasts 32: 29–36
- Duarte CM, Losada IJ, Hendriks IE, Mazarrasa I, Marbà N (2013) The role of coastal plant communities for climate change mitigation and adaptation. Nat Clim Chang 3: 961–968
- Fisher TR, Gustafson AB, Radcliffe GM, Sundberg KL, Stevenson JC (2003) A long-term record of photosynthetically available radiation (PAR) and total solar energy at 38.6° N, 78.2° W. Estuaries 26:1450–1460
- Fourqurean JW, Duarte CM, Kennedy H, Marbà N and others (2012) Seagrass ecosystems as a globally significant carbon stock. Nature Geosci 5:505–509
- Hanson PC, Carpenter SR, Kimura N, Wu C, Cornelius SP, Kratz TK (2008) Evaluation of metabolism models for

freewater dissolved oxygen methods in lakes. Limnol Oceanogr Methods 6:454–465

- Heip CHR, Goosen NK, Herman PMJ, Kromkamp J, Middelburg JJ, Soetaert K (1995) Production and consumption of biological particles in temperate tidal estuaries.
 In: Barnes H, Ansell AD, Gibson RN (eds) Oceanography and marine biology: an annual review. University College London Press, London, p 1–149
- Hemminga M, Duarte CM (2000) Seagrass ecology. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- Hoellein TJ, Bruesewitz DA, Richardson DC (2013) Revisiting Odum (1956): a synthesis of aquatic ecosystem metabolism. Limnol Oceanogr 58:2089–2100
- ^{*}Hu Z, Xiao Q, Yang J, Xiao W, Wang W, Liu S, Lee X (2015) Temporal dynamics and drivers of ecosystem metabolism in a large subtropical shallow lake (Lake Taihu). Int J Environ Res Public Health 12:3691–3706
- Hume AC, Berg P, McGlathery KJ (2011) Dissolved oxygen fluxes and ecosystem metabolism in an eelgrass (*Zostera marina*) meadow measured with the eddy correlation technique. Limnol Oceanogr 56:86–96
- Jähne B, Münnich O, Bösinger R, Dutzi A, Huber W, Libner P (1987) On the parameters influencing air-water gas exchange. J Geophys Res 92:1937–1949
- ^{*}Jennings E, Jones SE, Arvola L, Staehr PA and others (2012) Effects of weather-related episodic events in lakes: an analysis based on high-frequency data. J Freshwat Biol 57:589–601
- Josefson A, Rasmussen B (2000) Nutrient retention by benthic macrofaunal biomass of Danish estuaries: importance of nutrient load and residence time. Estuar Coast Shelf Sci 50:205–216
 - Kaas H, Markager S (1998) Technical guidelines for marine monitoring. National Environmental Research Institute, Aarhus
- Kamp-Nielsen L (1992) Benithic-pelagic coupling of nutrient metabolism along an estuarine eutrophication gradient. Hydrobiologia 235–236:457–470
 - Kemp WM, Boynton WR (1992) Benthic-pelagic interactions: nutrient and oxygen dynamics. In: Smith D, Leffler M, Mackiernan G (eds) Oxygen dynamics in Chesapeake Bay: a synthesis of research. Maryland Sea Grant Publications, College Park, MD, p 149–221
 - Kemp WM, Testa JM (2011) Metabolic balance between ecosystem production and consumption. In: Wolanski E, McLusky DS (eds) Treatise on estuarine and coastal science, Vol. 7. Academic Press, Waltham, p 83–118
- Kemp WM, Smith EM, Marvin-Dipasquale M, Boynton WR (1997) Organic carbon balance and net ecosystem metabolism in Chesapeake Bay. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 150: 229–248
- Kennedy H, Beggins J, Duarte CM, Fourqurean JW, Holmer M, Marbà N, Middelburg JJ (2010) Seagrass sediments as a global carbon sink: isotopic constraints. Global Biogeochem Cycles 24:GB4026
- Krause-Jensen D, Sand-Jensen K (1998) Light attenuation and photosynthesis of aquatic plant communities. Limnol Oceanogr 43:396–407
- Krause-Jensen D, Markager S, Dalsgaard T (2012) Benthic and pelagic primary production in different nutrient regimes. Estuaries Coasts 35:527–545
- Laas A, Noges P, Koiv T, Noges T (2012) High-frequency metabolism study in a large and shallow temperate lake reveals seasonal switching between net autotrophy and net heterotrophy. Hydrobiologia 694:57–74

- Lee JS, Kang DJ, Hineva E, Slabakova V, Todorova V, Park J, Cho JH (2017) Estimation of net ecosystem metabolism of seagrass meadows in the coastal waters of the East Sea and Black Sea using the noninvasive eddy covariance technique. Ocean Sci J 52:243–256
 - Mantikci AM (2014) Significance of plankton respiration for productivity in coastal ecosystems. PhD dissertation, Aarhus University, Aarhus
- Marino R, Howarth RW (1993) Atmospheric oxygen exchange in the Hudson River: dome measurements and comparison with other natural waters. Estuaries 16: 433–445
- Maxwell PS, Eklof JS, van Katwijk MM, O'Brien KR and others (2017) The fundamental role of ecological feedback mechanisms for the adaptive management of seagrass ecosystems—a review. Biol Rev Camb Philos Soc 92: 1521–1538
- McGlathery KJ, Anderson IC, Tyler AC (2001) Magnitude and variability of benthic and pelagic metabolism in a temperate coastal lagoon. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 216:1–15
- McGlathery KJ, Sundbäck K, Anderson IC (2007) Eutrophication in shallow coastal bays and lagoons: the role of plants in the coastal filter. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 348:1–18
- McGlathery KJ, Reynolds LK, Cole LW, Orth RJ, Marion SR, Schwarzschild A (2012) Recovery trajectories during state change from bare sediment to eelgrass dominance. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 448:209–221
- Mohn C, Göke C, Timmermann K, Andersen JH and others (2015) SYMBIOSE: ecologically relevant data for marine strategies. Technical Report No. 62, Danish Centre for Environment and Energy, Aarhus
- Mørk ET, Sørensen L, Jensen B, Sejr MK (2014) Air-sea CO₂ gas transfer velocity in a shallow estuary. Boundary-Layer Meteorol 151:119–138
- ^{*}Murrell MC, Caffrey JM, Marcovich DT, Beck MW, Jarvis BM, Hagy JD (2018) Seasonal oxygen dynamics in a warm temperate estuary: effects of hydrologic variability on measurements of primary production, respiration, and net metabolism. Estuaries Coasts 41:690–707
- Nielsen SL, Sand-Jensen K, Borum J, Geertz-Hansen O (2002) Depth colonization of Eelgrass (*Zostera marina*) and macroalgae as determined by water transparency in Danish coastal waters. Estuaries 25:1025–1032
- Nixon SW, Buckley B, Granger S, Bintz J (2001) Responses of very shallow marine ecosystems to nutrient enrichment. Human Ecol Risk Assess 7:1457–1481
- Öberg J (2006) Primary production by macroalgae in Kattegat, estimated from monitoring data, seafloor properties, and model simulations. Cont Shelf Res 26:2415–2432
- Obrador B, Staehr PA, Christensen JPC (2014) Vertical patterns of metabolism in three contrasting stratified lakes. Limnol Oceanogr 59:1228–1240
- Odum HT (1956) Primary production in flowing waters. Limnol Oceanogr 1:102–117
- Odum HT (1967) Biological circuits and the marine systems of Texas. In: Olson TA, Burgess FJ (eds) Pollution and marine ecology. Wiley, New York, NY, p 99–157
- Orth RJ, Carruthers TJB, Dennison WC, Duarte CM and others (2006) A global crisis for seagrass ecosystems. Bioscience 56:987–996
 - Petersen CGJ (1901) Fortegnelse over ålerusestader i Danmark optaget i årene 1899 og 1900 med bemærkninger om ruseålens vandringer etc. Be- retning til Landbrugsministeriet fra den danske biologiske station. 1900 og 1901. X: 3–28. København, centraltrykkeriet

- Riemann B, Carstensen J, Dahl K, Fossing H and others (2016) Recovery of Danish coastal ecosystems after reductions in nutrient loading: a holistic ecosystem approach. Estuaries Coasts 39:82–97
- Sand-Jensen K, Borum J (1991) Interactions among phytoplankton, periphyton, and macrophytes in temperate freshwaters and estuaries. Aquat Bot 41:137–175
- Short F, Wyllie-Echeverria S (1996) Natural and humaninduced disturbance of seagrasses. Environ Conserv 23: 17–27
- Solomon CT, Bruesewitz DA, Richardson DC, Rose KC and others (2013) Ecosystem respiration: drivers of daily variability and background respiration in lakes around the globe. Limnol Oceanogr 58:849–866
- Staehr PA, Borum J (2011) Seasonal acclimation in metabolism reduces light requirements of eelgrass (*Zostera marina*). J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 407:139–146
- Staehr PA, Sand-Jensen K (2007) Temporal dynamics and regulation of lake metabolism. Limnol Oceanogr 52: 108–120
- Staehr PA, Bade D, Van de Bogert MC, Koch GR and others (2010) Lake metabolism and the diel oxygen technique: state of the science. Limnol Oceanogr Methods 8:628–644
- Staehr PA, Testa JM, Kemp WM, Cole JJ, Sand-Jensen K, Smith SV (2012) The metabolism of aquatic ecosystems: history, applications, and future challenges. Aquat Sci 74:15–29
- Staehr PA, Testa JM, Carstensen J (2017) Decadal changes in water quality and net productivity of a shallow Danish estuary following significant nutrient reductions. Estuaries Coasts 40:63–79

Editorial responsibility: Robinson Fulweiler, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

- Steemann-Nielsen E (1951) The marine vegetation of the Isefjord—a study on ecology and production. Meddelelser fra Kommissionen for Danmarks Fiskeri- og Havundersøgelser 4:1–14
- Strickland JDH, Parsons TR (1972) A practical handbook of seawater analysis. Bull Fish Res Board Can 167:1–310
- Swaney DP, Howarth RW, Butler TJ (1999) A novel approach for estimating ecosystem production and respiration in estuaries: application to the oligohaline and mesohaline Hudson river. Limnol Oceanogr 44: 1509–1521
- Van de Bogert MC, Carpenter SR, Cole JJ, Pace ML (2007) Assessing pelagic and benthic metabolism using free water measurements. Limnol Oceanogr Methods 5: 145–155
- Wanninkhof R, Asher WE, Ho DT, Sweeney C, McGillis WR (2009) Advances in quantifying air-sea gas exchange and environmental forcing. Annu Rev Mar Sci 1:213–244
- Waycott M, Duarte CM, Carruthers TJB, Orth RJ and others (2009) Accelerating loss of seagrasses across the globe threatens coastal ecosystems. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 106:12377–12381
 - Weiss RF (1970) Solubility of nitrogen, oxygen and argon in water and seawater. Deep-Sea Res 17:721–735
- Wium-Andersen S, Borum J (1984) Biomass variation and autotrophic production of an epiphyte-macrophyte community in a coastal Danish area: I. Eelgrass (*Zostera marina* L.) biomass and net production. Ophelia 23:33–46
- Ziegler S, Benner R (1998) Ecosystem metabolism in a subtropical, seagrass-dominated lagoon. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 173:1–12

Submitted: February 1, 2018; Accepted: July 16, 2018 Proofs received from author(s): August 5, 2018